

## Columbian Encounters: 1992-1995



James Axtell

*The William and Mary Quarterly*, 3rd Ser., Vol. 52, No. 4 (Oct., 1995), 649-696.

Stable URL:

<http://links.jstor.org/sici?sici=0043-5597%28199510%293%3A52%3A4%3C649%3ACE1%3E2.0.CO%3B2-A>

*The William and Mary Quarterly* is currently published by Omohundro Institute of Early American History and Culture.

---

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of JSTOR's Terms and Conditions of Use, available at <http://www.jstor.org/about/terms.html>. JSTOR's Terms and Conditions of Use provides, in part, that unless you have obtained prior permission, you may not download an entire issue of a journal or multiple copies of articles, and you may use content in the JSTOR archive only for your personal, non-commercial use.

Please contact the publisher regarding any further use of this work. Publisher contact information may be obtained at <http://www.jstor.org/journals/omohundro.html>.

Each copy of any part of a JSTOR transmission must contain the same copyright notice that appears on the screen or printed page of such transmission.

---

JSTOR is an independent not-for-profit organization dedicated to creating and preserving a digital archive of scholarly journals. For more information regarding JSTOR, please contact [support@jstor.org](mailto:support@jstor.org).

# Columbian Encounters: 1992–1995

James Axtell

AS a public spectacle, the Columbus Quincentenary proved to be less heinous than even its fiercest critics could have predicted. Protestors had few celebrations to protest, and the media fell all over themselves issuing political corrections. An occasional can of red paint was thrown at Columbus statues and the touring ships' replicas, but an Indian co-marshal of the Rose Parade, peaceful vigils, and saturation newspaper and television interviews around October 12 were more typical of native participation. The city of Berkeley, California, predictably renamed Columbus Day "Indigenous Peoples Day," much as the admiral had claimed Guanahani as "San Salvador," and the United Nations postponed until 1993 its "Year of Indigenous Peoples" in order to devote full attention to the folks Columbus "discovered."

The only atrocity committed was the king's ransom the Dominican Republic—Haiti's relatively prosperous neighbor—paid to build a massive lighthouse to shoot a cruciform beam into the heavens. Other financial ventures were only slightly less ridiculous. One of the replica ships and several of its crew were stuck in New York City most of the winter of 1992 for lack of funds to return to Spain. Hollywood sank—the operative word—\$95 million into two Columbus movies, whose audiences stayed away in droves. The head of a 311-foot statue of Columbus—dubbed "Chris Kong"—sits in drydock in Fort Lauderdale and the rest of the body in Moscow and St. Petersburg because no American city—not even one of the fifty named for the explorer—would receive the Quincentenary gift from the republics of the former Soviet Union. The modest \$2 million budget of the official United States Jubilee Commission produced little more than a comic book, *Adventures on Santa Maria*; the commission's unpaid chairman, a Republican fundraiser appointed by President Reagan, was fired and investigated by Congress for fiscal and ethical improprieties involving the leasing of souvenir concessions to close friends. Considering the extreme paucity of sales of Quincentenary kitsch, the friendships may not have survived the indictments.

Ironically and fortunately, the Quincentenary's public pratfalls ensured that educational and scholarly lessons received attention. Throughout late 1991 and 1992, newspapers, national periodicals, and even airline magazines devoted space to substantive issues raised by the Encounter. *Newsweek* published a special fall-winter 1991 issue on the themes of the Smithsonian's "Seeds of Change" exhibit. Large audiences tuned in—at least initially—to

James Axtell is Kenan Professor of Humanities at the College of William and Mary and former chairman of the American Historical Association's Columbus Quincentenary Committee.

*The William and Mary Quarterly*, 3d Series, Vol. LII, No. 4, October 1995

the seven-hour PBS-TV series on "Columbus and the Age of Discovery," narrated by the engaging Mauricio Obregón. Public libraries all over the country mounted book displays or hosted traveling exhibits on Columbian themes, aided in good measure by annotated bibliographies and review essays in library and educational periodicals.<sup>1</sup> Hundreds of colleges and universities sponsored conferences, lectures, and new courses, occasionally on the admiral but mostly on his legacy. And the National Endowment for the Humanities continued its generous support of summer seminars for high school and college teachers interested in translating the new scholarship into their classrooms.

The number of books published on Quincentenary themes was enormous. Indeed, one can safely predict that the most durable legacy of the Quincentenary will not be the mediated events of 1992, no matter how muted or serious, but the tremendous flow of scholarship on the wide range of topics encompassed by the now-familiar phrase Columbian Encounters, only some of which was prompted by the historical anniversary. Since my previous review essay in this journal went to press in December 1991, more than 160 English-language books have appeared.<sup>2</sup> The present essay attempts to sketch briefly the contributions this substantial literature has made to our historical understanding of the five hundred and some years since 1492.

The Quincentenary scholarship since 1991 can be sorted into eleven categories: Columbus himself; the character of fifteenth-century Spain from which Columbus and his largely Castilian successors left for new and old worlds; the exploration and gradual definition of the world after Columbus; Spanish conquests and consolidation of empire in the Americas; Christian missions in the Americas; European colonization of the Americas and encounters with native peoples; disease, ecology, and native demography; the imperial implications of writing and the evolution of colonial discourse; the Quincentenary debate about Columbus and the subsequent half-millennium; museum exhibitions and catalogues; and eclectic conference and symposia publications.<sup>3</sup> If this anniversary has taught us anything, it has demonstrated

<sup>1</sup> The most comprehensive and useful bibliography is the Newberry Library's annotated *A Guidebook to Resources for Teachers of The Columbian Encounter*, ed. David Buisseret and Tina Reithmaier (Chicago: Herman Dunlap Smith Center for the History of Cartography, Newberry Library, 1992). The foreign-language scholarship is ably covered by David Block, "Quincentennial Publishing: An Ocean of Print," *Latin American Research Review*, 29, No. 3 (1994), 101-28. On the INTERNET, Millersville University of Pennsylvania has a "Columbus and the Age of Discovery Database" consisting of over 1,000 text articles from magazines, journals, newspapers, speeches, and official calendars; Thomas C. Tirado is the coordinator.

<sup>2</sup> "Columbian Encounters: Beyond 1992," *William and Mary Quarterly*, 3d Ser., 49 (1992), 335-60. A longer version appeared in my *Beyond 1492: Encounters in Colonial North America* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1992), chap. 11. The whole April issue of *WMQ* was devoted to "Columbian Encounters" of several kinds, with rewarding articles by Patricia Seed and Rolena Adorno on discursive encounters, John E. Kicza on Spain's precedents for overseas expansion, Delno West on Columbus historiography, and John D. Daniels on estimates of native population.

<sup>3</sup> By rights, the African slave trade to the Americas (begun in 1502) and its impact on Africa should be included. But the scholarship is so voluminous and my competence to do it justice so

that, for sound intellectual, not merely political, reasons, we should no longer restrict our attention to the Admiral of the Ocean Sea—whatever we think of him—but should try to understand the cultural and intellectual world from which he came and in which he continued to operate. We should attend particularly to the short- and long-range consequences of the unification of the globe and of the human, biological, and cultural encounters he inaugurated. This is the tack I take in summing up the scholarly legacy of the Quincentenary.

The major biographies of Columbus by Paolo Emilio Taviani, Felipe Fernández-Armesto, William D. Phillips, Jr., and Carla Rahn Phillips, and John Noble Wilford were all published in anticipation of 1992, and subsequent scholarship has tried to reconstruct the admiral's mental world or added details and tidied up facts.<sup>4</sup> Omnigraphics has published an indispensable English calendar and summary of 179 documents from the Genoese notarial archives. These prove beyond a doubt that Columbus was born in 1451 to the Christian family of a Genoese wool weaver and merchant, tavern keeper, and political appointee, that the future admiral made a trip to the Madeiras in 1478 to buy sugar for a firm of Genoese merchants in Lisbon, and that his devotion to Genoa was lifelong.<sup>5</sup> Helen Nader provides a short guide to Columbus's *Book of Royal Privileges*, a compilation of the rights, charters, and concessions the Spanish crown granted him since the famous Capitulations of Santa Fe in April 1492. Two of the four copies he had made in 1502 were sent for safekeeping to Genoa. The third was entrusted to his son Diego in Seville. In 1504–1505 Diego pled his father's cause at the court of King Ferdinand, first making a copy of key documents from the *Book of Royal Privileges*—at his father's suggestion—to bolster his arguments. This copy is reproduced in facsimile, transcribed, translated, and introduced by Nader for the John Carter Brown Library, where the manuscript has lived since 1890.<sup>6</sup> It shows Columbus doggedly fighting to be reinstated as admi-

---

small that I have omitted it, with real regret. Two good places to launch the subject are John Thornton, *Africa and Africans in the Making of the Atlantic World, 1400–1680*, Studies in Comparative World History (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992), and Philip D. Curtin, *The Rise and Fall of the Plantation Complex: Essays in Atlantic History*, Studies in Comparative World History (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990).

<sup>4</sup> Paolo Emilio Taviani, *Columbus: The Great Adventure: His Life, His Times, and His Voyages*, trans. Luciano F. Farina and Marc A. Beckwith (New York: Orion Books, 1991); Felipe Fernández-Armesto, *Columbus* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1991); William D. Phillips, Jr., and Carla Rahn Phillips, *The Worlds of Christopher Columbus* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992); John Noble Wilford, *The Mysterious History of Columbus* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1991).

<sup>5</sup> *Columbus Documents: Summaries of Documents in Genoa*, trans. Luciano F. Farina, ed. Farina and Robert W. Tolf (Detroit: Omnigraphics, 1992).

<sup>6</sup> *Rights of Discovery: Christopher Columbus's Final Appeal to King Fernando. Facsimile, Transcription, Translation and Critical Edition of the John Carter Brown Library's Spanish Codex I by Helen Nader* (Cali, Colombia, and Providence: Carvajal S. A. and The John Carter Brown Library, 1992). Professor Nader is also editing the *Book of Royal Privileges* for the UCLA Repertorium Columbianum.

ral, viceroy, and governor general of the Americas after his humiliating arrest and removal from office in 1500.

Some of the most useful Quincentenary scholarship cuts down to size extravagant and undocumented claims for Columbus. Rebecca Catz, *Christopher Columbus and the Portuguese, 1476-1498*, a repackaging of her careful research for a now-canceled volume of the UCLA Repertorium Columbianum, admits not only that "Columbus left not a trace of himself during the years he lived in Portugal" but that "we do not know for certain how or where [he] landed in Portugal" (perhaps at Lagos by washing ashore on an oar after a sea fight). "There is no documentary evidence to support the claim that Columbus ever lived in Madeira" (although he certainly did business there and his brother-in-law was governor). Catz also demolishes the myths of Columbus's Portuguese ancestry and of his work as a secret agent for King João II. In an appendix she translates a detailed account of Columbus's audience with João in March 1493 on his way home from his American discoveries. After Columbus "accus[ed] and upbraid[ed] the King for not having accepted his proposal" to sail for Portugal, João goodnaturedly presented Columbus's Indian captives with suits of scarlet grain and silenced the courtiers who suggested "that they do away with him." But the more Columbus talked, the more the king "saw what a garrulous person he was, all puffed up with his own importance, boasting about his abilities, and going on about this Cypango island [Japan] of his with greater fantasy and imagination than substance to what he was saying."<sup>7</sup>

Discoveries of new Columbus documents in Europe have also enlarged our understanding of his plans and achievements and his rhetorical mediations of both. Perhaps the single most important find is a mid-sixteenth-century copy of Columbus's initial postvoyage report to Ferdinand and Isabella, dated March 4, 1493, and written aboard ship in Lisbon. Until the publication of this letter by Antonio Rumeu de Armas in 1989, the world had its news of the discovery from two widely published, nearly identical letters, both dated February 15, 1493, addressed to Luis de Santángel and Rafael Sánchez, officials at the Aragonese court.<sup>8</sup>

In *Reading Columbus*, Margarita Zamora translates the new letter and argues convincingly that it actually predates the February letters, which were based upon it but were edited substantially—"sanitized"—by court officials with agendas. Indeed, the court text was "systematically censored on its way to becoming the public version of the announcement." The newly discovered letter contains no mention of the grounding of the *Santa Maria* on Christmas

<sup>7</sup> Contributions to the Study of World History, No. 39 (Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1993), viii, 1, 21, 83-99, 116, 118. William D. Phillips, Jr., renders equal service with his cautious *Before 1492: Christopher Columbus's Formative Years* (Washington, D. C., 1992), one of the "Essays on the Columbian Encounter" published by the American Historical Association in 1991-1992.

<sup>8</sup> *Libro Copiador de Cristóbal Colón: Correspondencia inédita con los Reyes Católicos sobre los viajes a América. Estudio histórico-crítico y edición* (Madrid: Ministerio de Cultura y Testimonio Compañía Editorial, 1989), 2 vols.

Day; it says cagily that “the *nao* that I brought I had left in Your Highnesses’ village of La Navidad, with the men who were using it for fortification.” The second caravel, Columbus griped, was also missing because “a man from Palos whom I had put in charge of her” (Captain Martín Pinzón) sailed off to collect gold on some island touted by the Indians. In general, Columbus admitted, “the vessels I brought with me were too large and heavy” for island exploration; he preferred “small caravels” but was persuaded by unreasonable and timorous crews to engage larger ships. These details were all excised from the court version, as was Columbus’s request for a cardinal’s hat for his underage son Diego and the royal bestowal of honor upon himself “according to [the quality of] my service,” as per contract. The greatest omission was Columbus’s conclusion that, with divine grace, “in seven years from today I will be able to pay Your Highnesses for five thousand cavalry and fifty thousand foot soldiers for the war and conquest of Jerusalem, *for which purpose this enterprise was undertaken.*” The crusade theme is prominent in Columbus’s writings from the third voyage on; this letter makes clear that he had discussed the plan with his sponsors well before the first voyage.<sup>9</sup>

The New York Public Library has tried to take advantage of the Quincentenary market by reproducing in facsimile and translation its unique copy of the first (Barcelona) edition of the court letter of February 15. There is actually no need for such a sumptuous, oversized, vanity publication of so-called *Columbus Papers* because editions and better translations of the one printed document are available. Obregón’s lengthy summary of Columbus’s first voyage in the NYPL volume adds nothing new, and the color reproductions of the Catalan Atlas (1375), a Ptolemaic *mappamundi* (c. 1490), and Juan de la Cosa’s world map (c. 1500) do not justify the hundred-dollar price tag.<sup>10</sup>

Valerie I. J. Flint’s *The Imaginative Landscape of Christopher Columbus*, on the other hand, is worth its weight in New World gold because it carefully reconstructs, in medieval terms, “the Old World which [Columbus] carried with him in his head.” From a penetrating examination of medieval *mappemondes*, Columbus’s reading of classical and medieval sources as revealed in his marginal notes, and the sea stories he knew or must have known (including those of Sinbad and St. Brendan), Flint shows that a surprising number of Columbus’s descriptions of what he found in the New World were “influ-

<sup>9</sup> (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1993), 9–20, 190–97 (emphasis added). Zamora also gives deft readings of Las Casas’s reconstitution of Columbus’s *diario* from a document of national and private interests to that of a disinterested Christian mission and of Columbus’s “feminization” of America and its natives for politico-cultural purposes.

<sup>10</sup> Samuel Eliot Morison’s translation is readily available in *Christopher Columbus, Mariner* (Boston: Little, Brown, 1955), 203–13, and in *Journals and Other Documents on the Life and Voyages of Christopher Columbus* (New York: Heritage Press, 1963), 180–87. Another translation by Cecil Jane and L. A. Vigneras can be found in *The Journal of Christopher Columbus* (New York: Bramhall House, 1960), 191–202. Jane’s translation and the Spanish original on facing pages are available in his scholarly edition of *The Four Voyages of Columbus*, 2 vols. in 1 (New York: Dover Publications, 1988), I, 2–19. Obregón, *The Columbus Papers: The Barcelona Letter of 1493 [trans. Lucia Graves], the Landfall Controversy, and the Indian Guides* (New York: Macmillan, 1991).

enced by, and reflect, particular expectations." "Scenes reenacted, as it were, behind his eyes, were reenacted before them, and were then reported to the admiral's sovereigns with all the imaginative and emotional intensity which drives the visionary." Flint argues persuasively that "certain of the most apparently fantastic of Columbus's ideas"—the location of the Terrestrial Paradise at the end of the east, for example, and a vast unknown land lying south of it—"were *precisely* the ones which allowed him to make the most important of his real discoveries," namely, the South American continent.<sup>11</sup> This learned and readable book will remain indispensable to Columbus studies for a long time; its consistent eschewal of anachronistic moralizing is exemplary.

Wider ranging but less valuable is Djelal Kadir's *Columbus and the Ends of the Earth: Europe's Prophetic Rhetoric as Conquering Ideology*.<sup>12</sup> Although Kadir claims to explore "the culture and context that engendered Columbus," he restricts himself to Columbus's sometime belief in his divinely appointed role as "Christ-bearer" and to evidence from Judeo-Christian typology and eschatology in gauging the prophet's role in history. As Flint's nuanced portrait shows, these limitations truncate Columbus. Kadir's major contribution is a comparative analysis of the political uses to which both Spanish Catholics and New England Puritans put a crusading ideology similarly derived from the late medieval rhetoric of prophecy that Columbus helped shape.

Another approach to Columbus's life and world is *1492: A Portrait in Music*, an entrancing one-hour video produced by the University of Oklahoma for PBS-TV. It features the "voice" of Ferdinand Columbus reading from his biography of his father as the camera explores in loving detail the art and architecture of their Spain. As the scenes move from Granada and Cordoba to Salamanca, Seville, and La Rabida, the Waverly Consort performs period music from Moorish, Jewish, and Christian traditions. Many of the songs come from scores in Ferdinand's extensive library, the remains of which are located in Seville Cathedral. One of the most evocative, "Ayo visto lo mappamundi," an Italian song popular at the Aragonese court of Naples around 1450, celebrates the wonders of nautical maps and their many islands.<sup>13</sup>

For small libraries that wish to catch up with the Columbus industry, the Library of Congress has reproduced on microfiche 505 titles from its collections, 235 of them in English. The mostly nineteenth- and twentieth-century novels, poems, biographies, and monographs in this collection enable students to research virtually every aspect of Columbus's life and legacy, includ-

<sup>11</sup> (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1992), xi, xiii, xiv.

<sup>12</sup> (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1992), xi, 32.

<sup>13</sup> Produced and directed by Eugene Enrico for the Center for Music Television, School of Music, University of Oklahoma, 1992. These syncretic traditions and their American impact are explored in Carol E. Robertson, ed., *Musical Repercussions of 1492: Encounters in Text and Performance* (Washington, D. C.: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1992), the result of a 1987 conference at the Smithsonian.

ing the various ways different countries have commemorated the centennials of his initial voyage.<sup>14</sup>

Just as we cannot understand the “discovery” of America without knowing Columbus, so we must know something of Columbus’s Iberian world to make sense of the explorer and the Spanish who followed him to the Americas. A collection of six essays on *The World of Columbus*, edited by James R. McGovern, makes a beginning by treating briefly the pictorial art, science, navigation, and music of the age. The most useful essay is Richard L. Kagan’s, which corrects several misconceptions about “The Spain of Ferdinand and Isabella.”<sup>15</sup> John Lynch’s expanded and substantially revised *Spain, 1516–1598: From Nation State to World Empire* (formerly volume one of *Spain under the Habsburgs*) is a comprehensive treatment of the Spanish economy, politics, and society from Columbus’s death to Philip II’s. Lynch’s explanations of the price revolution fueled by American silver and of Spanish military success in Mexico and Peru are particularly cogent.<sup>16</sup>

More directly pertinent to Columbus is Peggy K. Liss’s astute and nonflattering portrait of *Isabel the Queen*, the intelligent, militantly pious, and vengeful ruler of Castile who gave Columbus his main chance. Liss firmly lays the origins of the Inquisition (1478) and the expulsion of the Jews (1492) at the feet of *los Reyes*, Isabel’s no less than Fernando’s. Isabel’s quest for moral reform and political consolidation condemned the Muslims to defeat and the Jews to exile. Her order of expulsion, Liss argues, was “an extension of a war-nurtured ruthlessness” and “a recognition that the presence of Jews made Spain look old fashioned and heterodox” in the eyes of Christian Europe, just as her realm was assuming primacy. When Granada fell, the Jews’ fate in Spain was sealed, and the great majority, who chose not to convert to Christianity, left the country, just as Columbus was preparing to leave for the Far East with Their Majesties’ support.<sup>17</sup>

The subsequent history of the Sephardic diaspora is told in engaging detail by Paloma Díaz-Mas in *Sephardim: The Jews from Spain*. After describing the major beliefs and rituals of Sephardic Judaism, Díaz-Mas narrates the exiles’ wanderings, settlements, and cultural manifestations from the fifteenth century to the present. Although Judeo-Spanish or *Ladino* is fast dis-

<sup>14</sup> *Christopher Columbus Collection of the Library of Congress*, ed. Everette E. Larson (Bethesda, Md.: University Publications of America, 1991–1992). Claudia L. Bushman makes excellent use of these and other materials in *America Discovers Columbus: How an Italian Explorer Became an American Hero* (Hanover, N. H.: University Press of New England, 1992). Mexican novelist Ilan Stavans uses many of the same biographical and fictional treatments of Columbus to fashion a highly personal reading of “what did not [happen in 1492] but could have,” in *Imagining Columbus: The Literary Voyage*, Twayne’s Literature and Society Series, 4 (New York: Twayne Publishers, 1993), xvii.

<sup>15</sup> (Macon, Ga.: Mercer University Press, 1992). Kagan’s essay was first published in Jay A. Levenson, ed., *Circa 1492: Art in the Age of Exploration* (New Haven: Yale University Press and the National Gallery of Art, 1991), 55–61.

<sup>16</sup> (Oxford: Blackwell, 1991).

<sup>17</sup> *Isabel the Queen: Life and Times* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1992), 247, 264.



appearing, it was before World War II a distinct and vital language with many regional dialects worldwide and oral and written literatures that often retained a nostalgic affection for the Spain the Sephardim had left behind. While Díaz-Mas is interested primarily in literature and language, Jane S. Gerber's *The Jews of Spain: A History of the Sephardic Experience* is more roundedly historical and devotes five of nine chapters to Jewish life in Spain under the Moors and during the *Reconquista*. The remaining chapters chronicle the first and second diasporas to Islamic lands, Europe, and the New World and the gradual return of some 20,000 Jews to Spain after the Second World War.<sup>18</sup>

*Spain and the Jews: The Sephardi Experience, 1492 and After*, a collection of nine scholarly essays edited by Elie Kedourie, follows the same format. Henry Kamen's analysis of the expulsion is the most controversial. Kamen argues that the decision to expel the Jews came less from the Catholic kings than from the Inquisition, which from its founding in 1478 was convinced of "the great harm suffered by [mostly New] Christians from the contact, intercourse and communication which they have with the Jews, who always attempt . . . to seduce [them] from our Holy Catholic Faith." While Jewish communities were increasingly segregated from Christian, the Inquisition bore down on baptized Christians, not their Jewish tempters. Kamen emphasizes that the March 1492 decree of expulsion had "conversion, not expulsion, as its motive," and possibly half of Castile's and Aragon's 80,000 Jews did convert. Spain suffered economic consequences, not from the expulsion of the Jews (a small and disadvantaged minority), but from the persecution and emigration of Christian *conversos* between 1480 and 1492. The crown did not profit substantially from the Jewish expulsions, and "those who returned were given back their property in its entirety."<sup>19</sup>

In the same volume, Angus MacKay describes the checkered career of medieval Spain's 100,000 Jews (less than 2 percent of the population). In the twelfth and thirteenth centuries, Christians lived cheek-by-jowl with Muslims and Jews in a spirit of *convivencia* (coexistence). But MacKay cautions that "at all times the fundamental religious issues which divided Christians and Jews were present" and that "Christians combined hostility towards the Jews with a certain degree of grudging tolerance." Toward the end of the thirteenth century and during the fourteenth, *convivencia* broke down, leading to the bloody pogrom of 1391 and violent waves of anti-Semitism.<sup>20</sup> *Convivencia: Jews, Muslims, and Christians in Medieval Spain*, the illustrated catalogue of a major exhibition at the Jewish Museum in New York, synthesizes the scholarship on the cultural fusions and tensions that characterized the Iberian world from which Columbus sailed. Seven experts analyze the intermingling of cultures on the peninsula, even in difficult political circumstances, as manifested in poetry, literature, science, architec-

<sup>18</sup> Trans. George K. Zucker (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1992). (New York: Free Press, 1992).

<sup>19</sup> (London: Thames and Hudson, 1992), 75, 81, 84–85, 89.

<sup>20</sup> *Ibid.*, 33.

ture, and material culture. All chart the ways in which "interactions were sharply structured both by ethnic/religious ascription as well as by social class."<sup>21</sup>

Like any fifteenth-century Spaniard, Columbus was also familiar with the Moorish culture of Iberia. Moorish architecture, language, and dress were ubiquitous in Andalusia, and he was certain that the colorful cotton scarves worn by the natives on the coast of South America were *almaizares*, Moorish scarves.<sup>22</sup> The Quincentenary has provided easy access to this rich heritage. *al-Andalus: The Art of Islamic Spain*, edited by Jerrilyn D. Dodds, is the sumptuous catalogue of a blockbuster exhibition in the Alhambra and at the Metropolitan Museum of Art in New York in 1992. At 464 pages with 373 illustrations (324 in color), *al-Andalus* contains sixteen synthetic essays on the history and arts of Moorish Spain from 711 to 1492. Some 136 items—from delicate filigreed marble and ivory carvings to stunning textiles and illuminated manuscripts of the Qur'an—are described in detail. Intricate brass astrolabes from the taifa period in the eleventh century remind us how crucial Arabic technology and astronomy were to the success of European explorers in search of old and new worlds. Bells from Christian churches remade into mosque lamps after Moorish victories suggest that *convivencia* took many forms during the eight centuries before the Alhambra was surrendered to Ferdinand and Isabella, an event that Columbus witnessed with considerable self-interest.<sup>23</sup>

Richard Fletcher's short, learned, almost conversational treatment of *Moorish Spain* sorts out the political successions, religious disputes, and cultural legacies of the waves of Islamic invaders from North Africa who put an indelible stamp on Spanish culture. A hardheaded chapter on *convivencia* argues that Christians and Muslims were fundamentally hostile, discriminated against and enslaved each other, and kept apart as much as possible. But the demographic needs of the fourteenth century, particularly after the Black Death, dictated that Christian conquerors retain *Mudejar* colonists on the land, so the cultural mixing and oscillations of tolerance and persecution continued.<sup>24</sup>

In three elegant and erudite lectures entitled *Cultures in Conflict*, Bernard Lewis charts the linked fates of *Christians, Muslims, and Jews in the Age of Discovery*. Lewis newly contextualizes and closely relates the stories of the *Reconquista* (the West's crusading answer to the *jihad*), the expulsion of the Spanish Jews, and the discovery of America, all in 1492, through constant reference to the Muslim world and its universalizing ambitions. He reminds us that, while Islam was being pushed back in Iberia, it was making inroads in the eastern Mediterranean. Partly for this reason, the West sought to cir-

<sup>21</sup> Ed. Vivian B. Mann, Thomas F. Glick, and Jerrilyn D. Dodds (New York: George Braziller, 1992), 4.

<sup>22</sup> Jane, ed., *Four Voyages of Columbus*, II, 14.

<sup>23</sup> (New York: Metropolitan Museum of Art, distributed by Harry N. Abrams, 1992).

<sup>24</sup> (New York: Henry Holt, 1992). L. P. Harvey, *Islamic Spain, 1250 to 1500* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1990), is a more donnish treatment.

cumvent Islam's hold on the routes to the Far East by sailing and colonizing westward. Most of the Jews who were expelled from Spain in 1492 and from Portugal in 1496 found refuge in Ottoman Turkey, where "apostasy" from Christianity was a matter of state indifference. Although Christian Europe enjoyed several advantages, "it was above all the discovery of America . . . that ensured the triumph of Europe over its rivals, especially Islam, and the consequent universal acceptance of European notions and categories" of geography and ethnography.<sup>25</sup>

Two novel approaches to Columbus's world were also pursued in 1992. Lorenzo Camusso's *Travel Guide to Europe 1492* describes and illustrates with contemporary maps and art *Ten Itineraries in the Old World*, from such cities as Moscow, Lübeck, and Trondheim to Rome, Seville, and Istanbul. This history of travel, business, and religion makes an apt introduction to the age of maritime exploration dominated by Columbus's voyages. Equally intriguing is *The Guinness Book of Records 1492: The World Five Hundred Years Ago*, edited by Deborah Manley and compiled by an international bank of scholars. Augmented by abundant color illustrations, the book presents historical firsts and noteworthy facts on countless topics, Old World and New. Short entries retail information on such subjects as "Most misnamed bird" (*uexolotl* or turkey), "First umbrella reported in North America" (belonging to a southeastern *cacique* who shaded Hernando de Soto with it), and "First European syphilitic patient" (Martín Alonso Pinzón, the captain of the *Pinta*, who died from the disease in March 1493).<sup>26</sup>

Columbus's discovery of the American continent by sailing west to Asia accelerated a long process of global exploration, which *The Times Atlas of World Exploration*, edited by Fernández-Armesto, succinctly documents and handsomely illustrates with historical and modern maps and pictures. The folio-sized book covers some 3,000 Years of Exploring, Explorers, and Mapmaking, from c. 2,000 b. c. in the Graeco-Roman and Chinese worlds to recent satellite imaging from space. Legible reproductions and excellent maps drawn for the book—all in color—form the heart of forty-seven chapters. The text, written by twenty-two experts, and illustrations are enhanced by a long biographical glossary, a reasonably detailed index of place names, and a color-coded chronology of events in each of six major geographical regions. The chapter on Columbus wisely sidesteps the landing site controversy and focuses instead on his knowledge of the North Atlantic wind system to get him to the Caribbean and back. It also notes that "Columbus was as notable an explorer of coasts as of routes."<sup>27</sup>

William H. Goetzmann and Glyndwr Williams (one of the consulting editors of the *Times Atlas*) have produced a less ambitious atlas that should find regular use in history classrooms. *The Atlas of North American Exploration: From the Norse Voyages to the Race to the Pole* offers somewhat less legible

<sup>25</sup> (New York: Oxford University Press, 1995), 38, 69.

<sup>26</sup> (New York: Henry Holt, 1992). (New York: Facts on File, 1992), 42, 66, 138.

<sup>27</sup> (New York: HarperCollins, 1991), 48.

modern maps, shorter texts, and fewer illustrations in a smaller format to describe eighty-five phases of the exploration of the continent. A bibliography and general index augment the text.<sup>28</sup>

Both atlases could be approached differently after reading Eviatar Zerubavel's *Terra Cognita: The Mental Discovery of America*. This short volume reminds us that America, like any geographical space, "is both a physical and a mental entity, and the full history of its 'discovery' should therefore be the history of its physical *as well as mental* discovery." Through an effective, if not particularly novel or sophisticated, study of America's evolving (and sometimes "regressive") cartography, Zerubavel probes the psychological discoveries to argue that Columbus did not discover the continent "on a single day" and that not until 1778 were Europeans fully convinced by Vitus Bering's voyage that America was a fourth continent separate from the other three.<sup>29</sup>

It is all too easy, in the Quincentenary climate, to think of exploration and colonization as a Spanish monopoly. A.J.R. Russell-Wood provides a stimulating and palatable corrective in *A World on the Move: The Portuguese in Africa, Asia, and America, 1415-1808*, which not only places the voyages of Columbus in the context of a Portuguese age of discoveries but charts the global flux and reflux of people, commodities, ideas, flora, and fauna the Portuguese voyages set in motion. Nine simple line maps and eighty-four well-chosen black-and-white illustrations orient the reader to this complex portrait on a large canvas, as does a twenty-page bibliography. The beautiful and learned catalogue of a New York Public Library exhibition on *Portugal-Brazil: The Age of Atlantic Discoveries*, mounted by Wilcomb Washburn in 1990, is an indispensable supplement to Russell-Wood's book. Essays on astronomical navigation, exploring the Atlantic, cultural contact, and the literature of discovery complement 161 catalogue entries and numerous, large, color illustrations magnificently reproduced by Franco Maria Ricci. This tour de force of scholarship and printing should make it very difficult for historians to forget the role of Portugal in the Columbian Encounter.<sup>30</sup>

The Iberian opening and early dominance of the age of discovery is explained by Roger C. Smith in *Vanguard of Empire: Ships of Exploration in the Age of Columbus*. From archival documents, contemporary shipbuilding and navigational treatises, and wrecks found by underwater archaeologists, Smith meticulously describes the building, rigging, outfitting, manning, provisioning, arming, navigation, and sailing of the small, speedy, and maneuverable caravels and the larger *naos* that established Spain's and Portugal's lead in global navigation. These two ship types developed from an international spectrum of influences: "Mediterranean carvel hull construction and the use of multiple sails, the Muslim fore-and-aft lateen rig, the Baltic roundship design for long-distance hauling of bulk cargoes, the North Sea

<sup>28</sup> (New York: Prentice Hall, 1992).

<sup>29</sup> (New Brunswick, N. J.: Rutgers University Press, 1992), 5, 35, 115.

<sup>30</sup> (New York: St. Martin's, 1993). Ed. Max Justo Guedes and Gerald Lombardi (New York: The Brazilian Cultural Foundation, 1990).

sternpost rudder, and the Biscay tradition of seagoing small craft."<sup>31</sup> Columbus was the first to combine square and triangular sails—in a refitting in the Canaries—to take advantage of the northeasterly trade winds and to preserve maneuverability along the “West Indian” coasts, a pattern that became standard in the Atlantic *voltas* (ocean tracks).

That America was not named for a brilliant Genoese sailor but for a Florentine scholar, sometime pilot, and master of self-promotion is one of history's ironies. The translation and publication of Amerigo Vespucci's six *Letters from a New World* helps explain why North Columbia, South Columbia, and the United States of Columbia never made it onto the map. This handy edition, which is based on the critical edition in Italian by Luciano Formisano, establishes Vespucci's key role in publicizing the newness of Columbus's *otro mundo* (other world) and in arguing, on the basis of Vespucci's long voyage down the coast of Brazil, that the continent was not part of Asia, as Columbus continued to think.<sup>32</sup>

The effective Spanish discovery of the North American mainland was the unrewarded task of Juan Ponce de León, a veteran of Granada, conquistador, and former governor of a province in Hispaniola and of Puerto Rico. In 1512, the crown authorized him, at his own expense, to seek and conquer the “island of Beniny” somewhere north of Guanahaní. The following year, he failed to find the alleged wealth of Beniny but landed on the coast of Florida, which he named and claimed for Castile. Douglas T. Peck, an amateur historian and deepwater navigator, has reconstructed Ponce de León's route from James E. Kelley, Jr.'s expert translation of the ship's log (as digested by Antonio de Herrera in 1601, much as Bartolomé de Las Casas summarized and abridged Columbus's initial *diario*) and from Peck's retracing of the route in his own yacht. Contrary to myth, Ponce de León was not looking for the fountain of youth (one rival said, to cure his sexual impotence), and he touched land many leagues south of St. Augustine, which claims the discoverer as its own.<sup>33</sup>

In his 1985 book, *Spanish Sea*, Robert S. Weddle carefully described *The Gulf of Mexico in North American Discovery, 1500–1685*. He continues the story in *The French Thorn: Rival Explorers in the Spanish Sea, 1682–1762*, which traces French challenges to Spanish dominance after La Salle reached the gulf by canoe from the Mississippi.<sup>34</sup> While their focus is on cartography and exploration, both books pay considerable attention to relations with the natives and to the organizational snafus and nautical failures of the numer-

<sup>31</sup> (New York: Oxford University Press, 1993), 208. Smith helpfully provides glossaries of English, Spanish, and Portuguese nautical terms to offset the necessarily technical component of his text.

<sup>32</sup> *Letters from a New World: Amerigo Vespucci's Discovery of America*, trans. David Jacobson (New York: Marsilio, 1992). James E. Kelley, Jr., “Juan Ponce de León's Discovery of Florida: Herrera's Narrative Revisited,” *Revista de Historia de América*, 111 (1991), 31–65.

<sup>33</sup> *Ponce de León and the Discovery of Florida: The Man, the Myth, and the Truth* (St. Paul, Minn.: Pogo Press, 1993).

<sup>34</sup> (College Station: Texas A & M University Press, 1985); (College Station: Texas A & M University Press, 1991).

ous voyages along the Gulf Coast. The most famous narrative of Spanish disaster is Alvar Núñez Cabeza de Vaca's *Relación* or *Naufragios* (Castaways), a survivor's account of the ill-fated *entrada* of Pánfilo de Narváez on the western coast of Florida in 1527. Cabeza de Vaca and three companions, including the black slave Estevanico, made their way to the Texas coast, where Indians enslaved them. By 1536, they had rejoined company and walked to Spanish-controlled Mexico, serving as shamans and healers to grateful native groups en route. Enrique Pupo-Walker has edited a new translation of *Castaways* based on his critical edition of the 1555 Valladolid edition. The introduction is skimpy and opaque, the modern paintings by Ettore De Grazia are historically worthless, and the annotations on Indian groups are dated and ill informed.<sup>35</sup> Fortunately, Rolena Adorno and Patrick Pautz will soon publish their definitive edition and translation of the first (1542) Zamora edition of the *Relación* with the University of Nebraska Press.

The Quincentenary emphasis on the Spanish colonists and the Black Legend virtually ignored the sixteenth-century encounters of the French in South and North America. In the 1550s, France's short-lived colony in southern Brazil produced two major authors: Jean de Léry, a young Protestant pastor sent to tend Nicolas Durand de Villegagnon's settlers, and André Thevet, a Franciscan friar on a sightseeing tour of *France Antarctique*. After a year among the Tupinambas, Léry wrote *History of a Voyage to the Land of Brazil, otherwise called America*, which Claude Lévi-Strauss has called the "breviary of the anthropologist." Thevet, on the other hand, spent only ten (often sickly) weeks in the French settlement near the bay of Rio de Janeiro but drew on his American experience, wide reading, and imagination to write several weighty tomes of universalist cosmography, just as the genre was fading before the advent of specialized atlases, collections of voyages, and encyclopedias. In *Mapping the Renaissance World: The Geographical Imagination in the Age of Discovery*, Frank Lestringant laboriously dissects Thevet's controversial methods of compilation—a nearly postmodern anticipation of *bricolage* in which an indiscriminate Creator-like intelligence juxtaposed "singularities" from a global cabinet of curiosities, ancient fables, and anticipated discoveries.<sup>36</sup>

In *Portraits from the Age of Exploration*, editor Roger Schlesinger and translator Edward Benson give us twelve *Selections from André Thevet's Les vrais portraits et vies des hommes illustres*. Thevet's book, published in 1584, contained 232 biographical sketches of famous people from antiquity to his own day, each illustrated with an engraved portrait. Drawn from his brief travels in Brazil and Canada and from rare oral and archival information to which he had access as Royal Cosmographer to four Valois kings, Thevet's portraits

<sup>35</sup> *Castaways: The Narrative of Alvar Núñez Cabeza de Vaca*, trans. Frances M. López-Morillas (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1993). Mexican ethnologist Nicolas Echevarria's labored film "Cabeza de Vaca" (1992) should not be confused with history.

<sup>36</sup> Ed. and trans. Janet Whatley (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1990), xv (Lévi-Strauss). Trans. David Fausett, *The New Historicism: Studies in Cultural Poetics*, 32 (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1994).

of the six European explorers and six Indian leaders in this collection—the first of their kind in European literature—contain unusual ethnographic details and express a Renaissance humanist's admiration for the personal qualities of conquerors and victims alike.<sup>37</sup>

In the chapter on Francisco Pizarro (which sounds uncannily like a modern attack on political correctness), Thevet chides contemporary proponents of the Black Legend for their double standard in not also castigating England's Martin Frobisher for lusting after mineral wealth, ignoring Christian proselytizing, and kidnapping and killing American natives. An ambitious international research project on Frobisher's three voyages to the Canadian Arctic (1576–1587) has produced a collaborative volume on *Archaeology of the Frobisher Voyages*, edited by William W. Fitzhugh and Jacqueline S. Olin of the Smithsonian Institution. Parts of the book are highly technical, but several chapters are accessible narratives based on historical documents. Susan Rowley's essay on nineteenth-century Inuit accounts of the voyages describes several *kodlunas* (white men) who were shipwrecked on Kodlunarn Island, built a ship and sailed away, but were forced back by ice, and died from the cold while in the care of local Inuits. Further archaeological and archival research is attempting to verify this widespread oral tradition.<sup>38</sup>

Archaeologist Robert McGhee of the Canadian Museum of Civilization provides a lively summary of the latest scholarship on Frobisher and the other northern explorers in *Canada Rediscovered*. This *haute popularisation* is well illustrated with artifacts, maps, photographs, and modern drawings related to voyages and native encounters from those of Saint Brendan and the Vikings to Jacques Cartier's and the Basque whalers'. McGhee's coverage of the excavations of Basque whaling vessels in Red Bay, Labrador, and of Viking remains in L'Anse aux Meadows on the northern tip of Newfoundland will be particularly interesting to those who have not seen the pertinent issues of *National Geographic*. The major omission is a bibliography.<sup>39</sup>

At center stage of the Columbian Encounters was the Spanish conquest of what cartographers quickly called "The Indies," which included not only the Caribbean islands but Central and South America. Since Columbus was sailing on behalf of Castile and the Spanish established hegemony over what became known as Latin America within fifty years, we should not wonder

<sup>37</sup> (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1993). Schlesinger and Arthur P. Stabler also edited and translated *André Thevet's North America: A Sixteenth-Century View* (Kingston and Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1986).

<sup>38</sup> *Portraits from the Age of Exploration*, 34–36. (Washington, D. C.: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1993), chap. 2.

<sup>39</sup> (Ottawa: Canadian Museum of Civilization, 1991). Helge Ingstad, "Vinland Ruins Prove Vikings Found the New World," *National Geographic*, 126 (Nov. 1964), 708–34; James A. Tuck and Robert Grenier, "Discovery in Labrador: A 16th-Century Basque Whaling Port and Its Sunken Fleet," *ibid.*, 168 (July 1985), 40–71. Tuck and Grenier have extended their description in *Red Bay, Labrador: World Whaling Capital A.D. 1550–1600* (St. John's, Nfld.: Atlantic Archaeology, 1989).

that the great majority of Quincentenary books pertain to Spanish exploits in the Americas. The best books on the Caribbean appeared before 1992. Later and weaker is *Columbus and the Golden World of the Island Arawaks* by D.J.R. Walker, a retired colonial civil servant. This unoriginal narrative leans uncritically on Spanish accounts for data on Arawak culture and on Samuel Eliot Morison and anthropologist Irving Rouse for interpretations. Walker's view of the pre-Columbian islanders is as idyllic and implausible as Kirkpatrick Sale's in *The Conquest of Paradise*.<sup>40</sup>

Much more nuanced is Peter Hulme's and Neil L. Whitehead's *Wild Majesty: Encounters with Caribs from Columbus to the Present Day*, a splendid anthology of thirty-six accounts of the Island Caribs by explorers, missionaries, colonial administrators, travel writers, and film makers. This well-illustrated book is a history of Western perceptions of the Caribs rather than their own history or even a history of their relations with outsiders. The editors argue that the Caribs were closer to their allegedly peaceful Arawakan neighbors and enemies in both culture and language than the Columbian myth of Carib-cannibals has allowed and that their reputation for anthropophagy is grossly inflated. Unlike the Taínos, who are virtually extinct, populations of Caribs have flourished on the Carib reserve on Dominica (since 1903) and as so-called Black Caribs in Central America (since their forced relocation in 1797).<sup>41</sup> Their survival provided a rare reason to celebrate in 1992.

Hugh Thomas argues in *The Real Discovery of America* that the event occurred not in the Caribbean but in Mexico on November 8, 1519, when Cortés entered the lake-bound Aztec capital of Tenochtitlán for the first time.<sup>42</sup> The Spanish conquest of Mexico has attracted some of the best scholarship during the Quincentenary. The excavation of the Templo Mayor in downtown Mexico City (1978–1982) greatly enhanced our understanding of Aztec art, architecture, history, and ritual. Project director Eduardo Matos Moctezuma and religious historian David Carrasco summarize the latest scholarship in *Moctezuma's Mexico: Visions of the Aztec World*. Anthony F. Aveni and Elizabeth Hill Boone contribute essays on Aztec astronomy and the notion of landed empire to accompany 150 color illustrations of temples, artifacts, and codices.<sup>43</sup>

Inga Clendinnen takes a different tack in searching for the mood or “distinctive tonalities” of everyday Aztec life and culture. Taking “multiple, oblique and angled approaches, where possible against the grain of expectation,” she focuses less on the words than on the ritual actions of both male

<sup>40</sup> *Columbus and the Golden World of the Island Arawaks: The Story of the First Americans and Their Caribbean Environment* (Kingston, Jam.: Ian Randle Publishers; Sussex, Eng.: Book Guild, 1992). *The Conquest of Paradise: Christopher Columbus and the Columbian Legacy* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1990), chap. 5.

<sup>41</sup> (Oxford: Clarendon Press of Oxford University Press, 1992).

<sup>42</sup> *The Real Discovery of America: Mexico, November 8, 1519*, The Frick Collection, Anshen Transdisciplinary Lectureships in Art, Science, and the Philosophy of Culture, Monograph 1 (Wakefield, R. I., and London: Moyer Bell, 1992).

<sup>43</sup> (Niwot, Colo.: University Press of Colorado, 1992).



and female, elite and non-elite Mexicas, including war captives slated to lose their hearts to foreign gods. Clendinnen's sensitive reading of cultural symbols shows how ordinary citizens of the capital city made sense of their world, at once poetic and mannered and horribly violent.<sup>44</sup>

The narrative lines of the three-year conquest are familiar from William H. Prescott's classic *History of the Conquest of Mexico* (1843), but Lord Thomas has outdone Prescott (who never visited Mexico) in an 825-page grand retelling of *Conquest: Montezuma, Cortés, and the Fall of Old Mexico*, which adroitly adds insights drawn from 150 years of archaeological and codex scholarship and his own assiduous mining of Spanish archives. Although the Spanish and the Aztecs shared many cultural propensities and forms, Thomas argues that the Aztec empire was based on a "large static monarchy," unable to respond creatively to new challenges. Montezuma's "exceptional" superstitiousness and vacillation remain a mystery but help explain why the innovative Spanish adventurers under Cortés eventually won the day. We also learn about the lethal efficiency of smallpox and other imported diseases in weakening the Aztecs, who blamed their own blasphemies for this onslaught of the gods. Thomas is strong on the background of events. His thorough use of the 6,000-page judicial inquiry into Cortés's conduct (1529-1535), for example, has raised the number of accessible eyewitness Spanish accounts from ten to over a hundred. His description of Cortés's upbringing as a sickly only child in a poor, lower noble family in bellicose Extremadura explains much about the conqueror's ambition and military daring.<sup>45</sup>

At one-fourth the size, Ross Hassig's *Mexico and the Spanish Conquest* offers the best explanation of the Aztec defeat, particularly for the classroom. An ethnohistorian of Aztec Mexico, Hassig restores the native side of the story by arguing that the Aztecs lost not because of any ideological or spiritual collapse but because Cortés was able to enlist some 200,000 native allies. "Mexico was not conquered from abroad but from within. . . . The Aztecs did not lose their faith, they lost a war. . . fought overwhelmingly by other Indians, taking full advantage of the Spanish presence. . . . The war was more of a coup, or, at most, a rebellion, than a conquest. Conquest came later, after the battles, as the Spaniards usurped the victory for which their Indian allies had fought and died."<sup>46</sup>

The subsequent conquest of Mexico is the subject of excellent books by two of the best ethnohistorians of colonial Mexico, Serge Gruzinski and James Lockhart. Gruzinski's *The Conquest of Mexico* subtly charts "the least spectacular but perhaps most insidious manifestations" of Europeanization of Indian life—the revolution in native "modes of expression and communi-

<sup>44</sup> *Aztecs: An Interpretation* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991), I, II. See also her "Fierce and Unnatural Cruelty": Cortés and the Conquest of Mexico," *Representations*, No. 33 (1991), 65-100, reprinted in Stephen Greenblatt, ed., *New World Encounters* (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1993), 12-47.

<sup>45</sup> (New York: Simon & Schuster, 1993), xi.

<sup>46</sup> *Modern Wars in Perspective* (London and New York: Longman, 1994), 149.

cation, the disruption of memories, [and] the transformations of the *imaginaire*.<sup>47</sup> The Spaniards' imposition on, and often ready adoption by, the Indian nobility of alphabetic writing and Western artistic conventions, entailing new ways of seeing, experiencing, and representing reality, time, and space, the natural and supernatural—when combined with 97 percent mortality in central Mexico within a century—created such deep fissures in Indian society and “tore the nets” of native culture so badly that true syncretism and integration into Spanish colonial society were not possible. Yet the confusion and mixing of codes and genres, peoples and practices, allowed some room for cultural creativity and hybridization, at least in the first century of domination. This possibility is nowhere better illustrated than in Gruzinski's sumptuous *Painting the Conquest: The Mexican Indians and the European Renaissance*, a study of the pre- and postconquest codices that evolved to reconcile native religion, land titles, and histories with the new realities of Spanish lords, priests, and *encomenderos*.<sup>48</sup> Although traditional conventions, subjects, and colors were altered and written texts in Spanish, Latin, and Nahuatl were added, the persistence of pre-Columbian glyphs on Europeanized maps and paintings testifies to the tensile strength of even the torn net.

For more than twenty years, James Lockhart has studied Nahuatl, the Aztec language, and a large corpus of Nahuatl documents from central Mexico between 1545 and 1770. In his prize-winning book *The Nahuas after the Conquest*, he establishes the key importance of the “cellular or modular” organization of Nahua society and life based on the *altepetl* or ethnic state unit. “Everything the Spaniards organized outside their own settlements in the sixteenth century—the encomienda, the rural parishes, Indian municipalities, the initial administrative jurisdictions—was built solidly upon individual, already existing *altepetl*.” After exploring the cellular character of kinship, the household, politics, social orders, land tenure, and religion, Lockhart discerns in the evolution of the language three major stages of acculturation, which mirror very closely parallel stages in all the other facets of culture, including naming patterns, songs, history, art, and architecture. The three stages are:

- (1) a generation (1519 to ca. 1545–50) during which, despite great revolution, reorientations, and catastrophes, little changed in Nahua concepts, techniques, or modes of organization; (2) about a hundred years (ca. 1545–50 to ca. 1640–50) during which Spanish elements came to pervade every aspect of Nahua life, but with limitations, often as discrete additions within a relatively unchanged indigenous framework; and (3) the time thereafter, extending to Mexican independence and in many

<sup>47</sup> *The Conquest of Mexico: The Incorporation of Indian Societies into the Western World, 16th–18th Centuries*, trans. Eileen Corrigan (Cambridge: Polity Press, 1993), 2, 3. The book is a translation of *La colonisation de l'imaginaire* (Paris: Gallimard, 1988).

<sup>48</sup> Trans. Deke Dusinberre (Paris: Flammarion, 1992).

respects until our time, in which the Nahuas adopted a new wave of Spanish elements, now often more strongly affecting the framework of organization and technique, leading in some cases to a true amalgamation of the two traditions.

Rather than a model of stubborn resistance and crushing deculturation, Lockhart views isolation from Hispanic people and culture as the key explanation of the rates of cultural change. The Nahuas adopted and adapted Spanish introductions pragmatically, if they saw them as not too distinct from items in their own cultural repertoire. As isolation progressively broke down, so did Nahua resistance to the new items. Spaniards and Nahuas both suffered from what Lockhart calls "Double Mistaken Identity," whereby each side entertained "a flat, one-dimensional, simplified view of the other" and assumed that any foreign form or concept was and operated like one of its own. Fortunately, the cultural and social similarities were so marked that each side was able to operate for centuries on this false but workable presumption. These hypotheses have tremendous explanatory potential for the experience of other sedentary peoples subject to European conquest and dominion.<sup>49</sup>

The *Nahuas after the Conquest* should be seen as a rich complement to Charles Gibson's durable *Tlaxcala in the Sixteenth Century* and *The Aztecs Under Spanish Rule*, both of which rely largely on Spanish sources. Likewise, Lockhart's *Nahuas and Spaniards* and *We People Here* are worthy companions to his own magnum opus. *Nahuas and Spaniards* contains a dozen essays on *Postconquest Central Mexican History and Philology*, written between 1970 and 1990. The first chapter is an accessible summary of the *Nahuas* book, and two others locate the author in the historiography of Central Mexico, particularly relative to the work of Gibson and recent Nahuatlists. *We People Here: Nahuatl Accounts of the Conquest of Mexico*, edited and translated by Lockhart, is the beautifully produced, long-awaited inaugural volume of the UCLA Repertorium Columbianum. It contains six native documents, the longest being the Nahuatl and Spanish twelfth book of the Florentine Codex, begun around 1555 by Nahua speakers and writers trained by the Franciscan friar Bernardino de Sahagún. This is the only contemporary document that mentions omens prophesying the fall of the Aztec empire and draws a picture of Montezuma as quaking, indecisive, and effete and only one of three—all dated at least two decades after the conquest—that suggest that the Spanish were regarded initially as gods (a problematical term per se). Lockhart warns that we should not look to these documents for accurate expressions of the first Mexican reactions to the Spaniards because the main one was written by losers, seeking retrospective explanation of their defeat, and all were written many years after the events, allowing even oral tradition

<sup>49</sup> *The Nahuas After the Conquest: A Social and Cultural History of the Indians of Central Mexico, Sixteenth through Eighteenth Centuries* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1992), 14, 15, 429, 444–45.

to adjust to changing circumstances. But these vivid documents, translated in parallel columns and illustrated with codex drawings, are the clearest windows we have into the natives' view of their own experience. As such, it is salutary to learn that "none of the versions could be said to be about the Spaniards, or even primarily concerned with them." When the Spanish are mentioned, in passing, moral evaluation is lacking. "Castilians" or "Christians" simply stand outside the inclusive category of *altepetl* members who count.<sup>50</sup>

Until recently, we knew very little about the conquistadors of Mexico that a few famous participant-observers had not told us. Now, in addition to the letters of Cortés and the memoirs of Bernal Díaz de Castillo, we have Bernard Grunberg's 1992 Sorbonne dissertation on "The World of the Conquistadores during the Conquest of New Spain in the First Half of the Sixteenth Century," a prosopographical study that has been summarized in English in "The Origins of the Conquistadores of Mexico City." Of the 2,100 conquerors, nearly 60 percent were killed. Grunberg has compiled records on 1,212 individuals, largely from their service records. About 80 percent of these 1,212 came from Andalusia, León, Extremadura, and Old Castile, as did most immigrants. Most of the conquistadors were men in their twenties and thirties, but a fair portion was under twenty, often ship's boys or pages. About twenty were women, most in their thirties. Perhaps 10 percent were true *hidalgos*. As in the entradas of Peru and Central America, the rest practiced an array of occupations: sailors, carpenters, merchants, *letrados* (notary-secretaries), writers, navigators.<sup>51</sup> "Real soldiers were very few, and officers nonexistent." Eighty-four percent (96 percent of the *hidalgos*) could sign their names. Rather than bloodthirsty killers in search of gold, "they were primarily men who tried to find what they could not obtain in their native country." Their success lay in their courage and adaptability to new and dangerous circumstances.<sup>52</sup>

<sup>50</sup> (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1952). *The Aztecs Under Spanish Rule: A History of the Indians of the Valley of Mexico, 1519-1810* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1964). UCLA Latin American Studies, 76 (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1991). (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1993), 12, 14-15, 17, 19, 21. See also his "Sightings: Initial Nahuatl Reactions to Spanish Culture," in Stuart B. Schwartz, ed., *Implicit Understandings: Observing, Reporting, and Reflecting on the Encounters between Europeans and Other Peoples in the Early Modern Era* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994), chap. 7.

<sup>51</sup> Axtell, *Beyond 1492*, 258-59, 352 n. 23. José Ignacio Avellaneda's recent prosopography of *The Conquerors of the New Kingdom of Granada* (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1995) finds similar characteristics. Most of the 658 identifiable men of the 6 entradas that invaded Colombia between 1537 and 1543 were of the lower or lower-middle class, had little military experience, and could sign their names. They were on average 27 years old and hailed primarily from Andalusia, Old Castile, and Extremadura. Perhaps a third had been in the Indies less than a year.

<sup>52</sup> *Hispanic American Historical Review*, 74 (1994), 259-83. These immigrants brought an unusually vital medieval culture to the New World. Not only was the conquest of America "one of the last consequences . . . of the First Crusade," but the whole culture of early colonial Mexico was, according to Luis Weckmann, medieval in structure and feel (p. 4). Because Spain "had barely achieved the flowering of her medieval culture by the end of the fifteenth century," the Spanish "were able to transplant to the New World institutions and values that were archetypal of the Middle Ages in full flower" (p. 8). Weckmann's 700-page *The Medieval Heritage of*

The most successful invaders were granted *encomiendas*—the right to the tribute (goods and services) of the Indians of a native polity—for their services in the conquest of Tenochtitlán or in subsequent *entradas*. Robert Himmerich y Valencia provides for the first time a detailed prosopography of *The Encomenderos of New Spain, 1521–1555*, which distinguishes, as officials did, four degrees of *antigüedad* or seniority of arrival in New Spain. If the claimant did not possess obvious social status, preferably *hidalguia* (gentry) status, *antigüedad* was his greatest asset. Of the 506 *encomenderos* studied, 17 percent were *hidalgos* before arriving in Mexico, and 61 percent had arrived by 1520, before completion of the conquest the following year. On average, grantees received 1.5 *encomiendas*; more than half of all *encomiendas* were located within seventy-five miles of the *encomendero*'s urban residence. Even as the Indian population fell precipitously after conquest and the crown moved to emasculate the *encomienda* system, many *encomenderos* managed to consolidate their holdings through dynastic marriages, rights of succession, office holding, and partnerships.<sup>53</sup>

Himmerich's final chapter compares his findings with those of his graduate mentor, Lockhart, whose 168 *Men of Cajamarca*—the conquerors of Peru in 1532—formed a much smaller sample. Peru's liquid wealth and distance from crown control were greater than Mexico's, attracted more *hidalgos*, fomented fierce civil wars, and led to more rapid turnover of *encomiendas*. Both sets of *encomenderos* had about the same New World experience and followed the same occupations. More *Cajamarcanos*, however, used their war booty to return to Spain, whereas the more numerous Mexicans' modest wealth forced them to make their mark in America.<sup>54</sup>

*Transatlantic Encounters: Europeans and Andeans in the Sixteenth Century*, eight excellent essays edited by Kenneth J. Andrien and Rolena Adorno, also focuses on the Peruvian theatre of conquest. One by Lockhart dismisses the myths and discusses the rationality of Spanish and Indian economic activities along "Trunk Lines [from Atlantic ports to interior silver deposits] and Feeder Lines [indigenous supply routes to the Spanish capitals]." Another by Adorno deepens her study of *indios ladinos*—Indians who knew Hispanic customs and language—by describing their contemporary roles as messianic leaders, church assistants, petitioners, and writers. Perhaps the best piece is John F. Guilmartin, Jr.'s analysis of Spanish military superiority over the Incas, not in firepower but in steel weapons, horses, cohesion, and desire to kill rather than capture the enemy. "The suddenness and totality of the Inca military defeat," Guilmartin concludes, "lessened the amount and scope of cultural transfer in other areas of human endeavor. Having learned to

---

*Mexico*, trans. Frances M. López-Morillas (New York: Fordham University Press, 1992), exhaustively documents these medieval transfers and rebirths in virtually every aspect of Mexican culture.

<sup>53</sup> (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1991).

<sup>54</sup> Lockhart, *The Men of Cajamarca: A Social and Biographical Study of the First Conquerors of Peru*, Latin American Monographs, No. 27 (Austin: University of Texas Press for the Institute of Latin American Studies, 1972).

despise the Indians as armed foes, the conquistadors and their descendants were ill-disposed to respect them as subjects."<sup>55</sup>

The early conquistadors in eastern North America showed equally little respect for the Indians. Lucas Vásquez de Ayllón's short-lived colony on the South Carolina-Georgia coast in 1526 was predicated on the enslavement of local Indians. When three-quarters of the 600 colonists perished, many of the survivors headed for Mexico and Peru to try to make their fortunes.<sup>56</sup> One of those who struck it rich in Peru was Hernando de Soto, who returned to the Southeast to launch a fruitless and destructive search for wealth from 1539 to 1543. *The De Soto Chronicles*, published in two volumes in 1993, provides translated accounts by three members of the expedition and the longer, more literary account by Garcilaso de la Vega, "The Inca," who obtained his information in Spain from an officer and two soldiers some forty or fifty years later. A general introduction by Paul E. Hoffman, two substantial biographies of de Soto, several new documents from the General Archives of the Indies in Seville, a detailed itinerary of the expedition, and an extensive bibliography enhance the usefulness of these volumes. Three of the texts are newly translated—the fourth was well done in 1933—in order to render them more literal for the sake of historians, anthropologists, archaeologists, and literary critics interested in the entrada.<sup>57</sup>

Pinning down de Soto's tortuous route through the Southeast requires a daunting interdisciplinary effort. De Soto's artifacts must be distinguished from those left in Indian villages by other expeditions. Place names must be sorted out and allocated to known archaeological sites and modern locations. Textual descriptions must be related to culturally specific Indian practices. Distances and directions traveled must be plotted on modern and historical maps. Most of all, the texts themselves must be analyzed for their genetic relations and generic influences. (Patricia K. Galloway and seventeen other scholars have tackled many of these problems in a volume of studies in the historiography of the expedition, forthcoming from the University of Nebraska Press.) Charles Hudson has taken the lead in yoking disciplines together to establish the complete route and to assess the Spaniards' abusive and bloody relations with numerous native groups along the way. Hudson and Jerald T. Milanich have reconstructed the route's origins in *Hernando de Soto and the Indians of Florida*. The tail end of the journey receives detailed treatment in eighteen essays edited by Gloria A. Young and Michael P. Hoffman in *The Expedition of Hernando de Soto West of the Mississippi, 1541–1543*. David Henige throws a bracing dose of cold water on the scholarly

<sup>55</sup> (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1991). See also her "The Indigenous Ethnographer: The 'indio ladino' as Historian and Cultural Mediation," in Schwartz, ed., *Implicit Understandings*, chap. 13. Guilmarin, in *Transatlantic Encounters*, 62.

<sup>56</sup> Paul E. Hoffman, "Lucas Vásquez de Ayllón," in Jeannine Cook, ed., *Columbus and the Land of Ayllón: The Exploration and Settlement of the Southeast* (Darien, Ga.: Lower Altamaha Historical Society, 1992), 27–49.

<sup>57</sup> Lawrence A. Clayton, Vernon James Knight, Jr., and Edward C. Moore, eds., *The De Soto Chronicles: The Expedition of Hernando De Soto to North America in 1539–1543*, 2 vols. (Tuscaloosa: University of Alabama Press, 1993).

enterprise's argumentation and sources in a chapter that should be required reading for every student of early modern exploration. Until Hudson's comprehensive study of the entrada, *Knights of Spain, Warriors of the Sun: Hernando de Soto and the South's Ancient Chiefdoms*, is published, followers of the controversies can enjoy Joyce Rockwood Hudson's sprightly and often irreverent research travelogue, *Looking for De Soto*.<sup>58</sup>

Charles Hudson gives a preview of his latest thinking on the route and on de Soto's Indian relations in *The Forgotten Centuries: Indians and Europeans in the American South, 1521-1704*, a collection of eighteen related essays he edited with Carmen Chaves Tesser. The chapters fall into four sections on exploration; the native chiefdoms that dominated the Southeast when de Soto arrived but declined quickly in his lethal wake; structural changes due to disease, trade, and missions; and the formation of new peoples and polities from the remnants of the old. The freshest work is John E. Worth's "Late Spanish Military Expeditions in the Interior Southeast, 1597-1628" and Galloway's essay on the Choctaw "Confederacy as a Solution to Chiefdom Dissolution," which summarizes some of her forthcoming book on the Choctaws from the University of Nebraska Press.<sup>59</sup>

The Quincentenary's reminder that the Spanish were active in North as well as Central and South America should prompt more research on our Hispanic legacy, if modern ethnic politics does not. Those interested in taking up the challenge will be aided considerably by two guides to the voluminous collections of Spanish archival materials in the United States, primarily photostats or microfilms of colonial archives in Spain, Mexico City, and Havana. Both books resulted from a meeting of archivists, librarians, and historians at the Library of Congress in September 1987. *The Hispanic Experience in North America: Sources for Study in the United States*, edited by Lawrence A. Clayton, consists of the sixteen papers delivered on that occasion by users and curators. *The Hispanic World 1492-1898/El Mundo hispánico 1492-1898* is a bilingual, 1,071-page guide to Spanish documents on all the Americas that have been copied and preserved in the United States and its dependencies. In addition to a detailed guide to the collections of fifty-three research libraries, it contains a 3,600-entry bibliography on Spanish exploration and colonialism as well as sixty-one illustrations from important or striking photocopied documents.<sup>60</sup>

Another kind of visual research may be pursued in our national parks and historic sites. Bernard L. Fontana provides a brief, well-illustrated overview of Hispanic-related history and parks in *Entrada: The Legacy of Spain and Mexico in the United States*. Conceived as a book for park visitors to savor once home, its ninety-nine black-and-white illustrations (most quite small in

<sup>58</sup> Ripley P. Bullen Series, Florida Museum of Natural History (Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 1993). Proceedings of the De Soto Symposia 1988 and 1990 (Fayetteville: University of Arkansas Press, 1993), 155-72. Joyce Hudson, *Looking for De Soto: A Search Through the South for the Spaniard's Trail* (Athens: University of Georgia Press, 1993).

<sup>59</sup> (Athens: University of Georgia Press, 1994).

<sup>60</sup> (Columbus: Ohio State University Press, 1992). (Washington, D. C.: Library of Congress, 1994).

the wide margins), fifteen-page color portfolio of park sites, twenty-page bibliography, and detailed index make it equally useful for armchair explorers seeking a quick glimpse of the general subject. Those in search of more coherence and interpretation should turn to David J. Weber's masterly *The Spanish Frontier in North America*.<sup>61</sup>

For the Spanish crown, of course, the major reason for investing in the Americas was to extract their mineral wealth and to divert it to Spain, where it could finance international wars and trade and a rise in the standard of living of at least the noble and hidalgo classes. Since the publication of Clarence Henry Haring's *Trade and Navigation between Spain and the Indies in the Time of the Hapsburgs* in 1918, we have known how the famous Spanish *flotas* managed to transport American gold and silver and the magnitude of the gross receipts of the Casa de Contratación, the colonial watchdog, in Seville. But details about the bullion, bars, and coins themselves, their routes out of Spain into international markets and exchanges, and their impact on the world economy over time awaited the attention of Timothy R. Walton, a trained historian, serious coin collector, and analyst for the CIA. Walton's *The Spanish Treasure Fleets*, which takes the story of Spanish money to 1790 and beyond, is well researched in reliable English-language secondary sources (though not in the Seville archives where the flota records are kept) and is amply illustrated, often with photographs of coins from the author's collection.<sup>62</sup>

The claiming of native American lands, the extraction of their wealth, the often forcible conversion of Indians, and the atrocities committed against them raised serious legal and moral problems for the Spanish crown and many Spanish jurists and theologians. From his lectern at the University of Salamanca, theologian Francisco de Vitoria shook up political theorists all over sixteenth-century Catholic Europe with his scrupulous and exacting scholastic dismissal of all Spanish claims to Indian property in America and all justifications for compelling the natives to convert. The verbatim notes his students took between 1526 and 1540 (he did not publish in his lifetime but held onto his chair anyway) on the American Indians, just wars, and the evangelization of unbelievers are translated by Jeremy Lawrance and edited by Anthony Pagden in Vitoria's *Political Writings*. They reveal that "Vitoria had not quite argued his emperor out of the larger portion of his empire; but he had come perilously close to it."<sup>63</sup>

Vitoria's more famous contemporary, Bartolomé de Las Casas, also raised the crown's consciousness (if not hackles) with his relentless defense of the humanity and natural rights of the Indians, whose lives and often heinous deaths he witnessed as a priest in the Indies and as bishop of Chiapas. His first completed book, written in 1534, argued that *The Only Way to Draw All*

<sup>61</sup> (Tucson: Southwest Parks and Monuments Association; Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1994). (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1992).

<sup>62</sup> (Sarasota: Pineapple Press, 1994).

<sup>63</sup> Cambridge Texts in the History of Political Thought (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991), xxviii.



*People to a Living Faith* was through peaceful conversion by Christ-like missionaries, not by fire and sword. Like Vitoria, he defended with scholastic rigor native rights, condemned "false evangelization" that violated mind and will, and demanded full restoration of the freedoms and property of the "pagans" against whom unjust wars had been launched. Unlike Vitoria, Las Casas enjoyed visible political success. According to Helen Rand Parish, the editor of the new translation, *The Only Way* was "the basis, point by point, of the great papal encyclical *Sublimis Deus*, proclaiming the rationality and liberty of the Indians and the peaceful way to convert them. It was the foundation of Las Casas's greatest legislative success: Charles V's epochal New Laws for the Indies and the Indians" in 1542.<sup>64</sup>

In *Las Casas: In Search of the Poor of Jesus Christ*, Gustavo Gutiérrez, a Peruvian priest, gives a long and careful exegesis of Las Casas's numerous writings on the Indians and peaceful conversion. The 700-page book is an impassioned historical and spiritual exploration of the roots of liberation theology, aimed at modern priests, but it is also a sound and enlightening reading of Las Casas's central concerns as they grew out of his tumultuous life. His often innovative theology sprang from practical concerns and helped to persuade many Spanish contemporaries that the Indians were treated unjustly and without the charity that Christ showed to pagans and the poor. Las Casas was one of few observers to attribute those wrongs not to a few misguided individuals but to systemic oppression caused by wars of conquest (veiled under the term pacification) and the encomienda system. Without the Indians' explicit permission or invitation, Las Casas argued, the Spanish and other Europeans had no right to intrude upon native life or property and should make full restitution.<sup>65</sup>

Debates over Indian and Spanish rights in the Americas were not confined to the sixteenth century, nor were they as lopsided as the recent attention to Vitoria and Las Casas might suggest.<sup>66</sup> Apologists for the crown wielded the same sharp blades of scholastic argument to condone Spanish conquests and the imposition of Christian civility on the purported savages and pagans of Mexico, Peru, and elsewhere. One of the most forceful defenders of Spanish realpolitik was Juan de Solórzano Pereira (1575–1654), for twenty years a judge in the *Audiencia* (royal high court) in Lima and, after his return to Spain, an influential member of the Council of the Indies. This scholar-bureaucrat's two-volume *De Indiarum Jure* (1629–1639) represents the fullest development of a Christian theory of international relations, based on nat-

<sup>64</sup> *Bartolomé de las Casas: The Only Way*, trans. Francis Patrick Sullivan (New York and Mahwah, N. J.: Paulist Press, 1992), 4. Sullivan has also translated and edited a number of Las Casas's other tracts in *Indian Freedom: The Cause of Bartolomé de las Casas, 1484–1566: A Reader* (Kansas City: Sheed and Ward, 1995).

<sup>65</sup> Trans. Robert R. Barr (Maryknoll, N. Y.: Orbis Books, 1993).

<sup>66</sup> David M. Traboulay, *Columbus and Las Casas: The Conquest and Christianization of America, 1492–1566* (Lanham, Md.: University Press of America, 1994), also devotes chapters to Alonso de la Vera Cruz, student and colleague of Vitoria, and Alonso de Zorita, lawyer and member of three American *Audiencias*, who joined Vitoria and Las Casas in criticizing the Spanish treatment of Indians.

ural law and papal jurisdiction, and contains a number of biting observations on Spanish behavior in the New World. James Muldoon coolly and clearly analyzes the second book of the first volume—on the legitimate discovery, acquisition, and retention of the lands it designates as the West Indies—in *The Americas in the Spanish World Order: The Justification for Conquest in the Seventeenth Century*. With still-relevant medieval texts and methods, Solórzano defended Spain's and the Church's spiritual mission and the concept of a moral world order that not only rivaled Hugo Grotius's more secular vision but also set a standard by which the Spanish in the Americas—and their monarchs—continued to be judged and found wanting, thus contributing inadvertently to the Black Legend.<sup>67</sup>

As important as Churchmen and missionaries were in the cause of Indian rights, Christian churches of every denomination believed that they had a right as well as a duty to convert those they viewed as pagans of the New World. Some believed literally in the biblical injunction to “compel them to come in” (Luke 14:24) and did not hesitate to impose the new faith upon their often uncomprehending subjects. *Christianity Comes to the Americas, 1492–1776* was written by three religious historians to give 1992 audiences an overview of the missionary conquest that accompanied the invasion of traders, soldiers, settlers, and microbes. In 109 to 129 pages each, Stafford Poole, Robert Choquette, and Charles H. Lippy narrate—without a great deal of analysis—the gradual and incomplete Christianization of New Spain, New France and Louisiana, and the English mainland colonies respectively. Much is made of missionary fervor and hardship, but the churches' faults and myopias are not ignored. All three authors emphasize how different from their European progenitors the American religions looked by the time of the American Revolution, often as a result of Indian resistance and syncretism. With an eye on current polemical uses of Las Casas and the controversy over the canonization of Junípero Serra, Poole goes out of his way to argue that, because “there was never any planned or calculated desire to destroy the [Indians] as such,” *genocide* is an inaccurate description of “what happened in the Western Hemisphere.”<sup>68</sup>

Native religions and religious change in Ibero-America are impressively described and analyzed by eighteen scholars in *South and Meso-American Native Spirituality: From the Cult of the Feathered Serpent to the Theology of Liberation*, edited by Gary H. Gossen. After three chapters on the “great traditions” of Mexico, the Mayas, and the Andes, the book explores the importation of Hispanic Catholicism and the resulting syncretism in both the so-called great and little religious traditions of Latin America. Six final chapters probe the modern religious configurations formed by African immigrants and Protestants. The twenty essays that compose the book do not make the mistake of assuming that syncretism denotes the mingling of two

<sup>67</sup> (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1994).

<sup>68</sup> (New York: Paragon House, 1992), 125.

or more homogeneous and internally consistent systems of belief to produce an easily isolatable and analyzable new species. Instead, they draw our attention to the variants of belief and practice that came "not only from different religious orders and different statuses of individuals in the socioeconomic hierarchy of Spain and Portugal, but also from different personal biographies" and from those of the native Americans and Africans who encountered the Europeans. Gossen also reminds us that when the Spanish encountered the three great traditions between 1521 and 1560, those traditions "had been evolving and changing . . . for almost 2,500 years." They were thus related to earlier Andean and Mexican state religions "in a manner analogous to the relationship, say, between modern Roman Catholicism and the state religion of the Ancient Israelites under King David and King Solomon."<sup>69</sup>

One of the most learned and chronologically nuanced contributions to Encounter history is Sabine MacCormack's *Religion in the Andes: Vision and Imagination in Early Colonial Peru*, the first of two volumes on Inca and Andean cultures as they were understood by both Spaniards and natives from 1532 to c. 1660. Rather than seeking an aboriginally pure picture of Andean religion, MacCormack realizes that whatever understanding we may gain of native religious practice must come from the writings of men who were outsiders to that religion and often committed to its destruction, whether Spanish missionaries bent on extirpating "idolatry" or Christianized Andeans seeking to explain the similarities between their old and new religions. With the loss of the knotted *quipus*, mnemonic devices that carried much of Andean history, we have no choice. MacCormack brilliantly demonstrates that "the divergent theological and political programs these authors stood for conditioned not only their interpretation of Andean data, but also the way in which they selected those data." By the same token, she uses these shifting programs and perceptions to penetrate the "mental furniture, thoughts, and doings" of the Spanish invaders, including their Aristotelian and Thomistic notions of reality and perception. A happy bonus comes from MacCormack's expertise in Late Antiquity, which enables her to recognize striking parallels between the cultural dilemmas and religious syncretism of the new Christians of both eras.<sup>70</sup>

Kenneth Mills extends MacCormack's study in *An Evil Lost to View? An Investigation of Post-Evangelization Andean Religion in Mid-Colonial Peru*. This short monograph analyzes a long investigation of idolatry in one parish of the Archbishopric of Lima in the middle of the seventeenth century. The inquiry revealed a number of old Andean religious forms and practices: idols, *huacas* (regional gods), *malquis* (sacred ancestors whose preserved bodies were often kept in caves and ritually fed with llama blood, coca leaves, and *chicha*, a thick maize beer), *hechiceros* (sorcerers), and "dogmatizers" or teachers of ritual and tradition who threatened the demise of the Andean people if they forsook their old gods for the new Christian deity. The con-

<sup>69</sup> World Spirituality: An Encyclopedic History of the Religious Quest, 4 (New York: Crossroad, 1993), 18, 19, 20.

<sup>70</sup> (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1991), 5, 6.

tinuing demographic decline of the Indian population, which left many traditional religious offices unfilled, opened the way further for Spanish proselytizers but also frightened many natives into clinging to their traditional practices. In this new colonial world, villagers moved back and forth between the old and new religions and created new blends of belief and practice not fully comprehended by the term syncretism.<sup>71</sup>

One of the most powerful religious institutions translated to the Americas was the Holy Office of the Inquisition. It became especially important in Mexico after Cortés conquered a huge empire of Indian city-states and sought to incorporate their inhabitants into a new Spanish empire of church and state. Yet *Cultural Encounters: The Impact of the Inquisition in Spain and the New World*, edited by Mary Elizabeth Perry and Anne J. Cruz, reminds us that the vast majority of its cases involved not innocent, uncatechized Indians who never knew Christianity before the Spanish arrived, but Catholic priests who broke their vows, Jewish *conversos* alleged to have "Judaized" again, and Spanish blasphemers and heretics. Richard Greenleaf suggests that fewer than 1 percent of the total population—European, African, and Indian—were ever tried by the Holy Office, perhaps 2 percent of those tried were convicted, and only 0.5 percent were executed. After a few notorious burnings of idolatrous *caciques*, the Inquisition backed off the prosecution of Indians and effectively in 1548 (officially in 1571) handed jurisdiction over to officials entitled "provisors" at the diocesan or archdiocesan level. These guardians of the faith, as Robert Moreno de los Arcos and J. Jorge Klor de Alva maintain in *Cultural Encounters*, did not hesitate to investigate and prosecute cases of hiding idols, sacrificing to ancient deities, and practicing sorcery, witchcraft, folk curing, bigamy, and concubinage. Even more effective in "colonizing [the native] soul," argues Klor de Alva, was the imposition by parish priests and missionaries of sacramental confession and penitential discipline, which sought to replace the selective and random scare tactics of the Inquisition with a chastening effect upon "each word, thought, and deed of every individual Indian."<sup>72</sup>

Mexican Inquisition records also undergird much of Fernando Cervantes's short, fascinating book on *The Devil in the New World: The Impact of Diabolism in New Spain*. By the eighteenth century, Cervantes argues, the Inquisition turned a cool, rationalist eye on priestly and native accusations of diabolism in Indian religious practices and beliefs. In the previous two centuries, the Spanish had been prone to see the Devil everywhere in native life, leading the untutored Indians into sin and blasphemy. Initially, the

<sup>71</sup> Institute of Latin American Studies, University of Liverpool, Monograph Series, 18 (Liverpool, 1994). See also his article, "The Limits of Religious Coercion in Mid-Colonial Peru," *Past and Present*, No. 145 (1994), 84–121.

<sup>72</sup> (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1991), 12n, 269–70. The book resulted from an international conference held at UCLA and the University of Southern California in March 1988. See also Judith Laikin Elkin, *Imagining Idolatry: Missionaries, Indians, and Jews*, Program in Judaic Studies, Brown University, Occasional Paper No. 3 (Providence: John Carter Brown Library, 1992).

Indians could not fathom or accept the Christian notion of totally good or evil deities; their gods all partook of both qualities, as humans did. But because they believed that all gods had to be propitiated with sacrifices and offerings, many Indian traditionalists found it easier to incorporate the Christian devil into their inclusive religions: the Devil, in Spanish folk practice, required sacrifices. This new syncretic religion, Cervantes shows, was then absorbed by Spanish folk culture to complete the circle of influence.<sup>73</sup>

The evangelical thrust of Spanish Christianity was not confined to Latin America. Since about 1980, historians and archaeologists have been cooperating in a comprehensive scholarly investigation of the Spanish mission frontier of Florida and Georgia. At its height in the mid-seventeenth century, seventy Spanish friars manned forty missions controlling 26,000 Indians. These missions, stretching in an L-shaped chain westward and northward from the *presidio* of St. Augustine, supplied native labor and food to support the imperial regime of La Florida. *The Spanish Missions of "La Florida,"* edited by Bonnie G. McEwan, brings together the latest reports on nine archaeological sites, while two other chapters synthesize research on St. Augustine and missions south, and five analyze Spanish and Indian acculturation, health, and subsistence. The collection substantially complements the dozen essays on the Florida missions in the second volume of David Hurst Thomas's *Columbian Consequences* (1990). John H. Hann adds documentary depth to the Florida story with a 450-page translation of documents relating to *Missions to the Calusa*, a complex and powerful (though, surprisingly, nonagricultural) tributary society in southwestern Florida. Featuring documents dating from 1566 to 1760, the book shows that the Spanish crown had to instigate the Franciscan missions in the 1690s and that, after some success, the missions were brought to an end in the eighteenth century by disease, intertribal warfare, and English-allied Indians, who drove the Calusas into the Caribbean.<sup>74</sup>

Lest we think that the Spanish had a missionary monopoly in the New World, in 1992 the *American Indian Quarterly* published five articles with an introduction by John A. Grim in a topical issue on "Shamans and Preachers, Color Symbolism and Commercial Evangelism: Reflections on Early Mid-Atlantic Religious Encounter in Light of the Columbian Quincentennial." Here George R. Hamell continues his "Speculations on Color, Culture, and Contact" among the Iroquois, and Daniel K. Richter describes "Mohawk Protestantism, 1683-1719." Helen C. Rountree contrasts the worldviews and congregations of Powhatan priests and English rectors in Virginia, while

<sup>73</sup> (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1994).

<sup>74</sup> (Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 1993). One of the authors, Brent Richards Weisman, has published a book on *Excavations on the Franciscan Frontier: Archaeology at the Fig Springs Mission*, Ripley P. Bullen Series, Florida Museum of Natural History (Gainesville: University Press of Florida, 1992). Volume 2: *Archaeological and Historical Perspectives on the Spanish Borderlands East* (Washington, D. C.: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1990), chaps. 24-35. Ripley P. Bullen Series, Florida Museum of Natural History (Gainesville; University Press of Florida, 1991).

Neal Salisbury compares the colonial context of religious encounters in seventeenth-century New France and New England. William A. Starna probes the ideological consequences of epidemic disease in the Northeast.<sup>75</sup>

It has never been difficult for scholars of mission history to point out that Christian beliefs and practices have often proven extremely harmful to the American natives they were supposed to save and serve. The Quincentenary brought to the public fore a number of these indictments, directed particularly at the Catholic Church. In *Missionary Conquest: The Gospel and Native American Cultural Genocide*, Indian minister and professor of theology George E. Tinker briefly but forcefully argues that, by confusing the “kerygmatic content” of the Christian faith with the “accoutrements” of the missionaries’ own cultural experience and values, Christians of all denominations have been guilty of complicity in the destruction of Indian cultures and tribal social structures. In hard-hitting chapters on John Eliot, Junípero Serra, Pierre-Jean De Smet, and Henry Benjamin Whipple—two Protestants and two Catholics—Tinker applies an unabashedly “American Indian point of view” to an otherwise scholarly examination of the missionaries’ myopic if naive “good” intentions and the “genocidal” results of their efforts. In a thoughtful conclusion, he warns that missionaries and their supporters must be acutely aware of the systemic structures of colonialism in which they operate in order to halt future damage to native peoples.<sup>76</sup>

The encounters between America’s natives and newcomers took many forms and produced many kinds and degrees of change on both sides. No encounters would have occurred when and how they did had not Western European nations and peoples initiated a series of powerful “outthrusters” from the continent after 1400. Cecil H. Clough and P.E.H. Hair have edited a volume of essays in honor of David Beers Quinn on his eighty-fifth birthday entitled *The European Outthrust and Encounter: The First Phase c. 1400–c. 1700*, which limns the broad features of those related movements into northern Africa, Siberia, and the Far East as well as the Americas before presenting six case studies. Hair sees three stages of outthrust: (1) internal colonization of unpopulated lands close to home, (2) external colonization of populated lands farther away, and (3) latter-day reflection on the history of colonialism, often with ethical agony and “moralizing rhetoric.” According to Hair, the first two stages produced four major varieties of encounter: (1) encounters with the natural environment, (2) conquest, resulting in assimilation much more often than genocide, (3) rejection of the invaders or their culture by the native population, and (4) “opportunistic co-existence” involving “a significant degree of tolerance of ‘the Other’ imposed by the prospect of gain”—economic, technical, cultural, or ideological.<sup>77</sup>

<sup>75</sup> *AIQ*, 16 (1992), 445–519.

<sup>76</sup> (Minneapolis: Augsburg Fortress Press, 1993), 4.

<sup>77</sup> *Liverpool Historical Studies*, 12 (Liverpool University Press for the Department of History, University of Liverpool, 1994), 44–45, 51–53.

The large-scale movements of European peoples into foreign parts are traced in cogent detail by eleven authors in Nicholas Canny's collection, *Europeans on the Move: Studies on European Migration, 1500-1800*. The ten essays, eight of which are based on new research, treat the medieval expansion of Europe and the later outmigrations from Spain, England, Ireland, Scotland, the Netherlands, Germany, and France largely but not exclusively to the Americas. Ida Altman and James Horn's collection of seven essays, *"To Make America": European Emigration in the Early Modern Period*, covers similar but smaller ground. Two essays look at patterns of outmigration from Spanish localities, rural and urban, two at the recruitment of French emigrants for Canada and the Antilles, one at the free English bound for the Chesapeake, and one at German immigration to British North America. Both books underscore the tremendous variety of migratory peoples, motives, and methods that must complicate our future explanations of the American encounters on the European side and prevent us from attributing to the colonists only the clichéd motives "gold, glory, and the gospel."<sup>78</sup>

Equally salutary demands will be made by *Settlements in the Americas: Cross-Cultural Perspectives*, edited by Ralph Bennett. Twelve scholars plot the urban and rural settlement plans and patterns of Hispanic, English, and French colonizers in such diverse locales as Nassau, Providence Island, Puebla (Mexico), Santa Fe, Savannah, Philadelphia, and Quebec. Graziano Gasparini reminds us that many Latin American cities, thought to be built on the imported Roman-Renaissance grid pattern, had numerous native urban precedents in Mexico and the Andes.<sup>79</sup>

Once the European migrations were launched, the native polities of the New World began to crumble, and native cultures inexorably, though not always predictably, altered. On the surface, *Americas Lost, 1492-1713: The First Encounter*, edited by Daniel Lévine as a companion volume to an exhibition at the Musée de l'Homme in Paris, seems to be just another Quincentenary coffee table book, but it is an especially good one. Nine international experts have written eleven accessible but learned essays to complement a plethora of well-chosen, often unfamiliar illustrations ranging from the *Reconquista* to all the Americas in the eighteenth century, with a glance at dramatic "encounter" rituals in Mesoamerica today. The essays are divided into two parts, "The Encounter" and "The Coexistence." In the first section, Anne Vitart's brief chapter on "American Curiosities" traces Indians and Indian artifacts in Europe; in the second, Christian Duverger's essay on native conversions and Georges Baudot's on cultural syncretism (with its *castas* paintings of finely tuned categories of mixed-race offspring in Spanish America) stand out.<sup>80</sup>

<sup>78</sup> (Oxford: Clarendon Press of Oxford University Press, 1994). (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1991).

<sup>79</sup> (Newark: University of Delaware Press; London and Toronto: Associated University Presses, 1993).

<sup>80</sup> Trans. John Fergusson and Michael Barry (Paris: Bordas S. A., 1992).

Although the history of the American encounters usually depends on European written sources, scientific travel writer Ronald Wright uses surprisingly abundant native testimony to tell stories of the invasion, resistance, and rebirth of the Aztec, Mayan, Inca, Cherokee, and Iroquois peoples from Columbus to the present. Inspired by reading the Inca Guaman Poma's 1,200-page protest chronicle to King Philip III of Spain, Wright's *Stolen Continents: The Americas Through Indian Eyes Since 1492* is a consciously one-sided attempt to redress the historiographical imbalance. Unfortunately, it oversimplifies native realities and succumbs to facile moralizing; the invaders are all of a piece and the natives are all preternaturally wise and noble.<sup>81</sup>

In *Beyond 1492: Encounters in Colonial North America*, a collection of eleven essays, I seek not only to highlight native perspectives on the early encounters and on the Quincentenary but also to ensure that the voices of all parties—past and present, European and Indian—are heard and that the handling of moral issues is fair and complex. Particularly in “Native Reactions to the Invasion of America” and “Moral Reflections on the Columbian Legacy,” I try to complicate the normative past in order to secure justice for its native victims without doing new injustices to innocent immigrants. The trick is to restore proper agency to both natives and newcomers without minimizing or ignoring the constraints of power, culture, and biology within which both groups operated.<sup>82</sup>

Another approach to America's contact history that largely eschews moral considerations is archaeology. J. Daniel Rogers and Samuel M. Wilson have edited twelve essays on the interface between *Ethnohistory and Archaeology: Approaches to Postcontact Change in the Americas*. The contributors, all Americanist anthropologists or archaeologists by training, use written documents and archaeological findings in tandem to probe local and universal processes of acculturation, despite the “mixed epistemologies” involved in such an operation. Many of the authors explore how native perceptions, sociopolitical strategies, and aesthetic preferences helped determine the nature and impact of trade and of contact in general. Gregory Waselkov, for example, traces the emergence and changing face of factionalism among the Creeks after 1685. Personal possessions buried with Creek dead between 1700 and 1770 (and excavated before 1945) fall into distinct patterns of pro-English, pre-French, and mixed assemblages that exactly mirror the documented fortunes of South Carolina and Louisiana traders in Creek affairs. These diverse case studies of the Caribbean, North America, and Mesoamerica suggest that the natives' differential success in dealing with Europeans corresponded strongly to three factors: “the degree of sociopolitical integration of the indigenous peoples, precontact population density, and the timing and intensity of European contact.” They also contradict the conventional interpretation of Indian-white trade as “a supply-driven system.”<sup>83</sup>

<sup>81</sup> (Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1992).

<sup>82</sup> Axtell, *Beyond 1492*. I refine my arguments in “The Moral Dimensions of 1492,” *The Historian*, 56 (1993), 17–28.

<sup>83</sup> (New York: Plenum Press, 1993), 9, 123–31, 223, 225.



Less theoretically productive is Ivor Noël Hume's robust updating and retelling of *The Virginia Adventure: Roanoke to James Towne: An Archaeological and Historical Odyssey*. With his customary literary flair (and occasional license) and keen nose for historical drama, Noël Hume works familiar ground for more than 450 pages, enticing the reader with helpful maps, flavorful quotations, and 141 illustrations. Results from his own excavations at Wolstenholme Towne and at Roanoke—the latter uncovered some of Thomas Harriot's scientific equipment, perhaps intended to turn base metal into gold—as well as at Jamestown and Flowerdew Hundred and off the Bermuda coast add interesting and often important facets to America's foundational story. Although Indian characters appear much more frequently than in Noël Hume's previous books, they invariably play supporting roles to English gallants such as Walter Raleigh and John Smith. The underdeveloped state of historical and protohistorical Indian archaeology in the region is only partly to blame.<sup>84</sup>

Where one scholar lacks omniscience, an interdisciplinary team approach to early contact studies often succeeds. A 1988 conference in Portland, Maine, led to a handsome collaborative volume on *American Beginnings: Exploration, Culture, and Cartography in the Land of Norumbega*, the vaguely defined region around Penobscot Bay where French, English, and Indians contended for economic and political dominance from early in the sixteenth century to the middle of the seventeenth. Thirteen chapters probe the real and imagined limits of the region, native worldviews and relations with Europeans, the fishing industry, and nascent colonization. Their authors use archaeology, maps, folklore, and ethnohistory as well as documents to reveal the rapidly changing world of the Abenakis. The late J. B. Harley's essay "New England Cartography and the Native Americans" caps the collection with a brilliant deconstructive reading of the imperial presences and native absences on contemporary maps. Maps became not only European tools of "boundary making, of charter framing, of settlement planning, and of strategic value in the war of attrition against the Indians" but "the best testimony for the exclusion of the Indians from the territories of New England" and "a mirror to God's providence."<sup>85</sup>

After one of the English voyages to Maine in 1605, crewman James Rosier published an account with an Indian word list for "those that shal goe in the next Voyage." Presumably, his nautical successors made good use of Abenaki words such as *powwow*, *sagamore*, *moose*, and *tomahawk*. In *O Brave New Words!* Charles L. Cutler briefly describes the etymologies and dates the first usages of *Native American Loanwords in Current English* for a popular audience. Two glossaries of loanwords—a long one from Indian languages north of Mexico and a shorter one from Eskimo and Aleut languages—alphabetize the words whose histories Cutler sketches in 150 pages of undemanding text; an appendix provides another list of borrowings from Latin American Indian languages. Cutler also includes "Indianisms," English words or phrases that

<sup>84</sup> (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1994).

<sup>85</sup> Ed. Emerson W. Baker et al. (Lincoln: University of Nebraska Press, 1994), 313.

translate Indian expressions or are specifically related to Indians, such as "long knives," "Indian corn," and "happy hunting ground." All the words remind us that America's encounters were two-way streets, and a graph points out, ironically, that the invaders borrowed most heavily when they were winning most decisively, between 1875 and 1900.<sup>86</sup>

Before the Indians and immigrants could fashion a common tongue, they had to rely on interpreters and cultural brokers who could maneuver in the tight but fluid spaces between cultures. Both Indians and non-Indians (including Africans and *métis*) negotiated the changes and accommodations on both sides that the post-Columbian encounters entailed. Linguist Frances Karttunen's *Between Worlds* is a fascinating, often moving series of portraits of native *Interpreters, Guides, and Survivors*, male and female, who mediated cultural exchanges from sixteenth-century Mexico, Yucatan, and Peru to twentieth-century Mexico, Australia, and Rhode Island. A final chapter charts the social and economic costs to these intermediaries and to their children. Of most interest to colonialists are the stories of Cortés's interpreter and mistress Doña Marina (La Malinche), the Inca protestor Guaman Poma de Ayala, and Gaspar Antonio Chi, a noble Maya whose literacy in Spanish helped convert his people to Christianity but also subverted the worst cruelties of a deranged bishop and contributed importantly to our ethnographic understanding of ancient Mayan culture.<sup>87</sup>

Margaret Connell Szasz has edited a similar (and similarly titled) essay collection, *Between Indian and White Worlds: The Cultural Broker*. Fourteen contributors describe the mediating activities of native and Euro-American men and women from the late seventeenth to the late twentieth centuries not only as interpreters but as traders, healers, artists, and educators. Most of the figures in these two books were marginalized in their own cultures. In working with the Other on their particular cultural frontiers, they showed unusual degrees of curiosity, receptiveness, and determination, for which they received "rescue, protection, sustenance, recognition, companionship."<sup>88</sup>

In most societies, women are more susceptible to marginalization than are men, which often makes them skillful brokers and willing *Negotiators of Change*, the title of Nancy Shoemaker's ten-chapter edition of *Historical Perspectives on Native American Women*. Taking a cue from Kathleen Brown's stimulating chapter on "The Anglo-Algonquian Gender Frontier," Shoemaker argues that "cultural constructions of gender had as much influence on the contact experience as economic, political, and social interactions. Cultural ideas about gender difference provided a lens through which people looked at the Other and interpreted, or misinterpreted, the meaning of the Other's actions and words." Shoemaker's own chapter on "Kateri Tekakwitha's Tortuous Path to Sainthood" in the French Catholic *réserve* of Kahnawake shows that, while the Jesuits sought to implement patriarchy at their mis-

<sup>86</sup> (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1994), 15.

<sup>87</sup> (New Brunswick, N. J.: Rutgers University Press, 1994).

<sup>88</sup> (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1994). Karttunen, *Between Worlds*, 295.

sions, they also brought "the symbols, imagery, and rituals women needed to subvert patriarchy."<sup>89</sup>

Lest we forget, despite the valiant efforts of interpreters and cultural brokers on both sides, that many American encounters devolved into armed confrontations for hegemony or survival, Ian K. Steele has written *Warpaths: Invasions of North America*. He successfully brings together "the fashionable, if sometimes shrill and sanctimonious, field of ethnohistory" (which he has not practiced hitherto) and "the less fashionable, sometimes case-hardened and myopic, study of 'the colonial wars'" (which he has). Steele's first six chapters describe the establishment between 1513 and 1684 of the Spanish, English, French, and Dutch "Bases for Invasion." The next two analyze new and recurring patterns of warfare before 1748, when American wars were fought "primarily by and for colonists and Amerindians." How warfare changed when substantial numbers of European regulars arrived is the focus of the final four chapters. If ethnohistory is more evident in the first half of the book, the reason is due to the state of the field as well as to Steele's predilection for the military history of the Great War for Empire.<sup>90</sup>

Throughout the colonial period, another kind of battle was waged on North American frontiers. Peter C. Mancall's compact history of *Deadly Medicine: Indians and Alcohol in Early America* describes the efforts of competing European traders to entice native customers to swap their valuable pelts for low-cost, high-profit "firewater," of Indian leaders and Christian missionaries to keep the evil spirits out of native communities, and of natives and colonists alike to explain and cope with the social, economic, and spiritual damage wrought by Indian drinking. Mancall argues convincingly that "liquor was not a minor component of the so-called Columbian exchange." The alcohol trade became "crucial to the way colonists and Indians understood each other," and "neither Indians nor colonists could sever the . . . trade from the workings of the empire."<sup>91</sup>

Alcohol also contributed to the "providential" demise (as many colonists saw it) of Indian populations in early America by weakening the natives before the onslaught of epidemic diseases, which were also brought from Europe, inadvertently, as part of the now-familiar Columbian exchange. Since 1972, when Alfred W. Crosby popularized that phrase in his book of the same title, our understanding of the floral, faunal, and pathogenic exchanges between the Old and New Worlds has grown exponentially, thanks in part to the continued work of Crosby.<sup>92</sup> Because the original book is somewhat dated, teachers will be grateful that Crosby has published twelve of his occasional essays on *Germs, Seeds, and Animals: Studies in Ecological*

<sup>89</sup> (New York: Routledge, 1995), 20, 67.

<sup>90</sup> (New York: Oxford University Press, 1994), preface, 132.

<sup>91</sup> (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1995), 170, 180.

<sup>92</sup> *The Columbian Exchange: Biological and Cultural Consequences of 1492* (Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1972); *Ecological Imperialism: The Biological Expansion of Europe, 900-1900* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1986).

*History*. Appearing originally between 1976 and 1993, they treat, in Crosby's inimitably pungent style, topics such as the impact of the Columbian voyages, "The British Empire as a Product of Continental Drift," native mortality in North America and Hawaii, and the demographic impact of American crops in Europe. The introduction on "Nerds [Scientists] Versus Twits [Historians]" alone is worth the purchase price, especially when Crosby argues that, because "we humans are, before all else, organisms," the "history of bowels" is as important and as knowable as the history of international relations.<sup>93</sup>

As a special issue of the *Annals of the Association of American Geographers* makes clear, historical geographers also have much to teach us about the Columbian exchange. "The Americas before and after 1492: Current Geographical Research," edited by Karl W. Butzer, contains ten essays on the "pristine myth"—that the Indians had not altered the American landscape significantly before 1492—agricultural practices in Latin America before and after Columbus, the impact of disease on native populations and property, and the exploration and colonization of North America. William M. Denevan explodes the pristine myth by demonstrating that, "by 1492, Indian activity had modified vegetation and wildlife, caused erosion, and created earthworks, roads, and settlements throughout the Americas." By 1650, Daniel W. Gade shows, Andean highland farmers had selectively adopted from the Spanish a dozen plants (mostly wheat and barley), several animals (especially sheep and mules), the scratch plow and sickle, and adobe dwellings with thatched roofs in efforts to cope with conquest and depopulation. Carville Earle's "Pioneers of Providence: The Anglo-American Experience, 1492–1792" is a model of how the true syncretism of history and geography can re-energize a familiar subject.<sup>94</sup>

The ecological consequences of introducing Spanish grazing animals to a region of central Mexico between 1530 and 1600 is the subject of Elinor G. K. Melville's monograph, *A Plague of Sheep*. Melville shows in tragic detail how the natives' "intensive irrigation agriculture shifted to extensive pastoralism; the region was transformed from a complex and densely populated agricultural mosaic into a sparsely populated mesquite desert; and the indigenous populations were economically marginalized while land and regional production passed into the hands of large landowners who were socially (if not always ethnically) Spanish."<sup>95</sup> As Crosby, William Cronon, Timothy Silver, and Carolyn Merchant have done for several other areas of the colonial world, Melville charts the symbiotic roles of environmental degradation and the conquest of native peoples in Spanish America in ways that should breed imitators.<sup>96</sup>

<sup>93</sup> (Armonk, N. Y.: M. E. Sharpe, 1994), xiv-xv. *Chilies to Chocolate: Food the Americas Gave the World* (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1992), ed. Nelson Foster and Linda S. Cordell, contains 10 short popular essays on such plants as amaranth, vanilla, chili pepper, and cacao, most by scientists and anthropologists.

<sup>94</sup> *AAAG*, 82 (1992), 379.

<sup>95</sup> *A Plague of Sheep: Environmental Consequences of the Conquest of Mexico*, Studies in Environment and History (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994), 14.

<sup>96</sup> Crosby, *Ecological Imperialism*; William Cronon, *Changes in the Land: Indians, Colonists,*

The severe decline of native American populations, often as high as 90 percent in the first century after contact, prompted two scholarly responses during the Quincentenary: condemnation and explanation. David E. Stannard's *American Holocaust: Columbus and the Conquest of the New World* is firmly in the former camp, and his conscientious research and impassioned writing make him its leader. Like his ideological predecessor, Kirkpatrick Sale, Stannard paints an idyllic picture of pre-Columbian America (conveniently ignoring, among many other things, the possibly genocidal blood sacrifices of the Aztecs) and then blames (the operative word) European racism, sexism, ethnocentrism, greed, and Christianity for spoiling the Indians' Eden and committing "genocide" against "tens of millions" of hapless natives in senseless "orgies of human destructiveness." In laying out his moral indictment of virtually all Euro-American, particularly Christian, colonists and their modern United States successors, Stannard inflates native population estimates as high as possible and constantly elides the crucial distinction between deaths caused by human agency and volition and mortality from uncontrollable pathogens. The natives who died "from forced labor, from introduced disease, from malnutrition, from death marches, from exposure, and from despair," he argues, "were as much victims of the Euro-American genocidal race war as were those burned or stabbed or hacked or shot to death, or devoured by hungry dogs." While Stannard's heart may be in the right spot, his mind was clearly made up long before launching his research, and his historical explanations are too facile and unrefined to convince anyone but the already convinced.<sup>97</sup>

While not ignoring human cruelty, witlessness, and atrocities, the authors represented in three collections of essays on disease and death in post-Columbian America provide more nuanced, more time- and space-specific, and ultimately more convincing explanations than do the moral castigators. Noble David Cook and W. George Lovell, the editors of nine essays comprising "*Secret Judgments of God: Old World Disease in Colonial Spanish America*," emphasize that, while smallpox and measles were the biggest killers of Indians, the web of endemic and epidemic disease was "a complex gestalt, one in which the whole was decidedly more ruinous than the sum of its lethal parts," which they select for close analysis. Their concluding chapter, "Unraveling the Web of Disease," is a clear introduction to the modern science of epidemiology that informs so many documentary studies of past outbreaks.<sup>98</sup>

---

*and the Ecology of New England* (New York: Hill and Wang, 1983); Timothy Silver, *A New Face on the Countryside: Indians, Colonists, and Slaves in South Atlantic Forests, 1500–1800*, Studies in Environment and History (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990); Carolyn Merchant, *Ecological Revolutions: Nature, Gender, and Science in New England* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1989). Carl Ortwin Sauer inaugurated the study of American conquest ecology, particularly in his still-essential *The Early Spanish Main* (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1966), recently reprinted in paperback.

<sup>97</sup> (New York: Oxford University Press, 1992), ix, xi, 255.

<sup>98</sup> (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1991), 216–17. Suzanne Austin Alchon's essay on 18th-century Quito in this collection draws on her book, *Native Society and Disease in Colonial Ecuador*, Cambridge Latin American Studies, No. 71 (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991).

*Disease and Demography in the Americas*, containing twenty-seven essays edited by John W. Verano and Douglas H. Ubelaker from a Smithsonian symposium in November 1989, focuses on native population loss and its effects primarily in North America. Wielding the technical tools of paleopathology, the authors of the first fourteen chapters put to rest the myth of a disease-free precontact America. Indians all over the Americas suffered from chronic infectious diseases such as tuberculosis and treponematosiis (varieties of yaws or syphilis), rheumatoid arthritis, Rocky Mountain spotted fever, intestinal parasites, and dental caries. But they were free from—and therefore not immune to—the deadly crowd infections of the Old World, which ran riot through the virgin soil populations of the New World. The final thirteen chapters offer differing assessments of the human costs of these losses, according to “the size of the aboriginal population, fluctuation in population size prior to European contact, the extent to which disease impact preceded actual population contact, the magnitude and severity of the epidemics, and regional or local variability in the timing and rate of population decline.”<sup>99</sup>

A similar, though less conclusive, book resulted from a meeting of the American Association of Physical Anthropologists in April 1992. *In the Wake of Contact: Biological Responses to Conquest*, edited by Clark Spencer Larsen and George R. Milner, contains fifteen papers on native illness, diet, habitual activities, and workload as revealed by archaeological remains of human bones and teeth. The authors find “no simple dichotomies between precontact and postcontact populations,” partly because they acknowledge the presence of debilitating and life-threatening diseases and trauma in pre-Columbian America. Their evidence does register significant, often serious, changes after contact. Pueblo and Florida villagers suffered more head wounds (from Spanish swords); Omahas and Poncas in Nebraska ate better after acquiring horses and firearms, although Omaha women wore down their front teeth chewing buffalo hides for an expanded trade, and everyone suffered serious (though seldom lethal) lead poisoning from imported red pigment and metallic lead used to make ornaments and musket balls; Guale Indians on the Georgia coast grew slightly more robust, even as quality and variety of their diet decreased, but suffered more physical stress and injuries from doing manual labor for Spanish missionaries.<sup>100</sup>

Europe’s invaders managed to conquer the Americas and to dominate encounters with the natives not simply because of their microscopic allies but because they commanded perdurable tools of literacy. As a major growth sector of scholarship has shown since 1991, the conquest of America was in part a victory of paper and print over memory and voice. The victors wrote their way to the New World and inscribed themselves on its maps

<sup>99</sup> (Washington, D. C.: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1992), 2. See also Charles F. Merbs, “A New World of Infectious Disease,” *Yearbook of Physical Anthropology*, 35 (1992), 3–42.

<sup>100</sup> (New York: Wiley-Liss, 1994), 5.

and in its histories so as to minimize or exorcise the natives' voice and presence. Fortunately, they did not always succeed, and the resulting discourse between colonizers and colonized was always shaped to some extent by natives who refused to be silenced. Like colonial society in general, colonial literary culture was a complex web of negotiations between viable if unequal contestants.

In Latin America, the Spanish assault on native culture also took the form of suppressing alternative forms of literacy and the demonization and burning of the native equivalent of books. Assuming that alphabetic writing, Latin grammar, and (conventionally) bound books modeled after the sacred medieval codex were the sole standards for those genres, Spanish missionaries and *letrados* were quick to dismiss as undecipherable or childish Mesoamerican and Andean hieroglyphics, pictographs, and abstract signs (such as the colored, knotted strings of the *quipus*) as nonwriting and to condemn to the flames the painted, accordionlike paper records and sacred texts of the Mexica and the Mayas as dangerously infested by the devil. When constructing grammars of the new American languages, the Spanish lamented the absence of certain roman letters (which they equated with sounds) and stuffed the living tongues into the grammatical strait-jacket of classical Latin, not even contemporary Castilian. *Writing without Words: Alternative Literacies in Mesoamerica and the Andes*, twelve essays edited by Elizabeth Hill Boone and Walter D. Mignolo, describes these pre-Columbian systems and their postcolonial fates in rich detail.<sup>101</sup>

In a number of suggestive articles and a recent book, Mignolo has also shown that the newcomers were no more tolerant of native histories. Once they concluded that the Indians did not have proper historiography, Spanish chroniclers "appointed themselves to write and to put into a coherent form the narratives that, according to their perception, Amerindians told in a thoroughly incoherent manner." In mistrusting and suppressing the natives' voices, the Spanish effectively colonized native memories. Just as written grammars "took the place of the natives' implicit organization of languages," so written histories "took the place of natives' explicit recording of the past."<sup>102</sup>

<sup>101</sup> (Durham, N. C.: Duke University Press, 1994). Mignolo's chapter on "Signs and Their Transmission: The Question of the Book in the New World" is particularly relevant.

<sup>102</sup> Mignolo, "On the Colonization of Amerindian Languages and Memories: Renaissance Theories of Writing and the Discontinuity of the Classical Tradition," *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 34 (1992), 301-30, quotation on 310. See also Mignolo, "Literacy and Colonization: The New World Experience," in René Jara and Nicholas Spadaccini, eds., *1492-1992: Re/Discovering Colonial Writing, Hispanic Issues*, 4 (1989), 51-96; Mignolo, "Nebrija in the New World: The Question of the Letter, the Colonization of Amerindian Languages, and the Discontinuity of the Classical Tradition," *L'Homme*, 32, Nos. 122-124 (1992), 185-207; Mignolo, "When Speaking Was Not Good Enough: Illiterates, Barbarians, Savages, and Cannibals," in Jara and Spadaccini, eds., *Amerindian Images and the Legacy of Columbus, Hispanic Issues*, 9 (1992), 312-45; Mignolo, "Literacy and the Colonization of Memory: Writing Histories of People without History," in Deborah Keller-Cohen, ed., *Literacy: Interdisciplinary*

A spate of recent books and exhibit catalogues explores the paper war against the Indians. Arguing that “the tide of discovery rose on an ocean of ink” and that “America was history’s first media event,” antiquarian Lynn Glaser assembles a personal montage of late fifteenth- and sixteenth-century words, maps, and pictures but eschews any conclusions about *America on Paper: The First Hundred Years*. The John Carter Brown Library and the DeGolyer Library at Southern Methodist University published catalogues of Hispanic book exhibits in 1992. *Spanish Historical Writing about the New World, 1493–1700* by Angel Delgado-Gomez is a beautifully illustrated and printed descriptive catalogue of sixty-nine volumes in the JCBL collections. For the DeGolyer exhibit, Jane Lenz Elder’s *The Literature of Beguilement: America from Columbus to Today*, nearly as handsome, describes ninety-one items—maps, travel brochures, and architecture as well as books—that attempted to sell, first, Hispanics on America and, later, Americans on the Hispanicized Southwest. Additionally, James C. Murray’s *Spanish Chronicles of the Indies: Sixteenth Century* is a handy guide to the writings of such literary conquistadors as Oviedo, Bernal Díaz, Gomera, Zorita, and Cieza de León.<sup>103</sup>

Beatriz Pastor Bodmer’s *The Armature of Conquest: Spanish Accounts of the Discovery of America, 1492–1589* subtly analyzes the ideology of conquest and its fate in the face of New World realities. Bodmer traces Spanish colonial discourse from “mythification” of America and its natives (Columbus and Cortés) through “demythification” as rebellion or failure (Cabeza de Vaca) to critical disillusionment over accepted versions of the discovery and conquest (Ercilla).<sup>104</sup> José Rabasa, on the other hand, would have us deny the epistemological reality of America and concentrate on its perpetual “invention.” In *Inventing A-M-E-R-I-C-A: Spanish Historiography and the Formation of Eurocentrism*, Rabasa deconstructs the “ongoing process of colonization” implicit in sixteenth-century written and visual representations of the New World and the structure of Eurocentrism they have bequeathed to us. That structure, he argues, “established the universality of European history and subjectivity” and a “unified, univocal world picture.” By assuming—in good post-structuralist fashion—that “verbal texts, maps, icons, and other cultural products should be taken as rhetorical artifices and not as depositories of data from which a factual truth may be construed,” Rabasa hopes to liberate colonized native voices and knowledges. This “countercolonial” exercise is imaginatively focused upon Columbus’s writings, the correspondence between Cortés and Charles V, the encyclope-

---

*Conversations* (Creskill, N. J.: Ablex, 1994), 91–114; Mignolo, *The Darker Side of the Renaissance: Literacy, Territoriality and Colonization* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 1994).

<sup>103</sup> (Philadelphia: Associated Antiquaries, 1989), 1. (Providence: John Carter Brown Library, 1992 [1994]). (Dallas: DeGolyer Library, Southern Methodist University, 1992). Twayne’s World Authors Series, 847 (New York: Twayne Publishers, 1994).

<sup>104</sup> Trans. Lydia Longstreth Hunt (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1992). The book was originally published in Spanish in 1983 and revised in 1988.



dic compendia of Oviedo, Franciscan ethnographers, Las Casas, and Gerhard Mercator's Atlas, though Rabasa does not attempt to construe the reciprocal Indian invention of the Europeans.<sup>105</sup> Working from the same assumptions, Peter Mason focuses on European (originally Plinian) constructions of "monstrous" figures in South America in *Deconstructing America: Representations of the Other*. Mason's readings are far denser than Rabasa's and are obscured by an excess of Continental jargon.<sup>106</sup>

*Coded Encounters: Writing, Gender, and Ethnicity in Colonial Latin America*, the product of a 1990 symposium at the Five Colleges of Massachusetts honoring Lewis Hanke, is a more eclectic probe of the literature of encounter. Fifteen chapters examine maps as ideologically constructed discourses, foods as cultural signs of "civility" and "savagery," Cabeza de Vaca's peaceful pacification of northern Mexico, cultural resistance in the Andes, the teaching of native neophytes new ways to sin sexually through explicit confession manuals, and the domestic and religious voices of women in colonial Mexico. Mignolo's essay on the differences between European and Indian geographical conventions and the gradual repression of native territory in the colonizers' maps is a worthy complement to the cartographic deconstructions of the late J. B. Harley.<sup>107</sup>

Not to be outdone by post-structuralists, New Historicists have contributed subtle readings of *New World Encounters*. Stephen Greenblatt has edited fourteen essays—most of them originally published in a special 1991 issue of *Representations* in honor of Michel de Certeau—on subjects such as Cortés's martial ferocity, Cabeza de Vaca's "negotiation of fear," Aztec poetry before and after conquest, Raleigh's feminization of America, and Elizabethan tobacco. All these readings suggest that "the discourses of colonialism actually do much of the crucially important work of colonialism" but also attempt to "register the powerful presence of otherness—not an abstract, quasi-allegorical figure of the Other, whether brute or victim, but a diverse range of cultures and representations and individuals with whom Europeans were forced to interact."<sup>108</sup>

Less theoretically driven are three interdisciplinary collections of essays. *Early Images of the Americas: Transfer and Invention*, twelve chapters edited by Jerry M. Williams and Robert E. Lewis, focuses on the history, literature, law, and science of Hispanic America as they affected European thought and sensibility. Michael Palencia-Roth's illustrated essay on cannibals is perhaps the highlight of these exceptionally clear and accessible treatments of the sixteenth century. At 750 pages, René Jara and Nicholas

<sup>105</sup> Oklahoma Project for Discourse and Theory, II (Norman: University of Oklahoma Press, 1993), 3, 8, 9, 21.

<sup>106</sup> (London and New York: Routledge, 1990).

<sup>107</sup> Ed. Francisco Javier Cevallos-Candau, Jeffrey A. Cole, Nina M. Scott, and Nicomedes Suárez-Araúz (Amherst: University of Massachusetts Press, 1994). For Harley's challenging work see Axtell, "Columbian Encounters: Beyond 1992," 341–42.

<sup>108</sup> Greenblatt, *New World Encounters*, viii, xvi.

Spadaccini's collection, *Amerindian Images and the Legacy of Columbus*, offers something for nearly everyone interested in Hispanic engagements with America and the Americans. Two essays on Father Ramón Pané, Columbus's Taíno expert, are especially welcome. *Implicit Understandings*, a 600-page collection edited by Stuart B. Schwartz, is unusual among Quincentenary fare for devoting more attention to encounters in other parts of the early modern world than in the Americas and thereby giving us an invaluable comparative context for evaluating the abundant scholarship on the latter. Nineteen chapters are divided into four parts: European visions of others in the late Middle Ages; Persian, Nahua, African, Asian, and Japanese visions of Europeans (the most interesting section); European and indigenous adjustments to encounter in China and the Andes; and encounters in the age of Captain Cook. A fourteen-page annotated bibliography is a bonus.<sup>109</sup>

Two thoughtful books by intellectual historians of Europe and a conference collection round out the literature of encounter. The authors of all three volumes are interested in the impact of the discovery and colonization of America upon the thinkers and thinking of contemporary Europe. Anthony Pagden's *European Encounters with the New World: From Renaissance to Romanticism* consists of five independent essays on the ways a variety of European intellectuals—from Columbus and Oviedo to Diderot and Humboldt—tried to make sense of the newness of the New World and to bridge the chasm of "incommensurability" between themselves and the American "others." Pagden concludes, as did his Enlightenment favorites, that three centuries of close contact "had done little, or nothing, to bridge the cultural divide." The ultimate lesson was "a form of despair: the recognition that the 'savage,' however defined, could ultimately have no place outside a world system whose character was already markedly European, yet could never survive as a savage within it."<sup>110</sup>

Anthony Grafton's *New World, Ancient Texts: The Power of Tradition and the Shock of Discovery*, the aptly illustrated companion volume to an exhibit of 200 treasures from the New York Public Library in late 1992, outlines with admirable clarity and economy the European scholarly canon's progression from dominant stasis through challenge and confusion resulting from the American discoveries to reformulation between 1450 and 1700. Following John H. Elliott and Michael Ryan, Grafton argues that the impact of the New World upon the Old was muted and slow. An intellectual revolution did occur, but "it resulted as much from contradictions between and tensions within the [ancient] texts as from their confrontation with external novelties." The texts served as "both tools and obstacles for the intellectual exploration of new worlds." "Confronted by the New

<sup>109</sup> (Tucson: University of Arizona Press, 1993). *Hispanic Issues*, 9 (1992). (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1994). The book resulted from a conference at the University of Minnesota in October 1990.

<sup>110</sup> (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1993), 14, 187, 188.

World, none of the available texts proved either too sterile to be useful or so useful as to survive unchanged." Yet for all their flexibility, they were not able to bridge the cultural and human gap that divided Europeans from Americans.<sup>111</sup>

Inspired by Elliott's work in the 1970s, the JCBL sponsored a conference in 1991 on "America in European Consciousness, 1493-1750," twelve of whose twenty-five papers have been edited by Karen Ordahl Kupperman in a book of that title. The contributors are seriously divided over the nature, timing, and degree of impact of the discoveries. But all are certain that while Europe's interest in America was "utterly self-referential," "the lands on both sides of the Atlantic were very different in 1750 from what they would have been had the ocean never been crossed." One of the most interesting chapters is Elliott's "Final Reflections," which reiterates his earlier conclusion that "perhaps dreams were always more important than realities in the relationship of the Old World and the New." While acknowledging that Europeans showed more interest in the new discoveries (as judged by their reading, image consumption, and references in personal letters) than he had previously thought, Elliott admits that he does not know how to assess the degree of assimilation of the new information. He still argues that the impact was "deliberately blunted, as part of Europe's defensive strategy against an outside world that in some ways it was afraid to understand."<sup>112</sup>

During the Quincentenary, teachers, scholars, and activists generally lined up on two sides to debate the nature and 500-year legacy of the Columbian Encounter. One camp blamed Columbus and his European successors for all the deaths and misery of America's natives (and African slaves) to the present. Indian spokespersons and their non-Indian supporters in this camp tended to speak in broad generalities about greed, racism, and ethnocentrism as the root causes of alleged genocide and ecocide and to include virtually all Euro-Americans in their indictments. Their writings sought to short-circuit the expected celebratory character of the Quincentenary, which in general they did, less by making disinterested scholarly analyses of the past than by connecting the grim past of their

<sup>111</sup> With April Shelford and Nancy Siraisi (Cambridge, Mass.: Belknap Press of Harvard University Press, 1992); Elliott, *The Old World and the New, 1492-1650*, Cambridge Studies in Early Modern Europe (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1970); Elliott, "Renaissance Europe and America: A Blunted Impact?" in Fredi Chiappelli, ed., *First Images of America: The Impact of the New World on the Old*, 2 vols. (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1976), I, 11-23; Michael T. Ryan, "Assimilating New Worlds in the Sixteenth and Seventeenth Centuries," *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 23 (1981), 519-38. See also G. V. Scammell, "The New Worlds and Europe in the Sixteenth Century," *The Historical Journal*, 12 (1969), 389-412. Grafton, *New Worlds, Ancient Texts*, 6, 10.

<sup>112</sup> (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press for the Institute of Early American History and Culture, 1995), 5, 393, 401.

ancestors and their own far-from-satisfactory present with carefully selected, emotionally charged historical vignettes and images and often eloquent expressions of sadness, pain, and anger.<sup>113</sup> At the same time, a significant cohort of native scholars and academics resorted to more traditional modes of argument and documentation to fashion powerful interpretations of the American past, which all students of the Encounter must confront as they search for the larger truths about it. Particularly provocative are *Confronting Columbus: An Anthology*, edited by John Yewell, Chris Dodge, and Jan DeSirey, which includes several articles from a special "View from the Shore" issue of the *Northeast Indian Quarterly*; "Encounter of Two Worlds: The Next Five Hundred Years," a special issue of the *American Indian Culture and Research Journal*; and *The Unheard Voices: American Indian Responses to the Columbian Quincentenary, 1492-1992*, the proceedings of a 1992 conference at UCLA edited by Carole M. Gentry and Donald A. Grinde, Jr.<sup>114</sup>

The other camp sought to complicate the moral and historical issues by distinguishing among Euro-American (and Indian) groups and even individuals, by contextualizing events to avoid anachronism, by emphasizing the impartial role of disease, and by seeking understanding before, if not rather than, judgment. A number of articles defended Columbus and "the West" against the historical attacks and "misperceptions" of the counter-camp, some in mass media publications.<sup>115</sup> The most cogent response was Robert Royal's book, *1492 and All That: Political Manipulations of History*, and his pamphlet, *Columbus on Trial: 1492 v. 1992*.<sup>116</sup> That the issue of genocide is still hotly debated in *Perspectives*, a publication of the American

<sup>113</sup> See, for example, Ray Gonzalez, ed., *Without Discovery: A Native Response to Columbus* (Seattle: Broken Moon Press, 1992); Thomas Christensen and Carol Christensen, eds., *The Discovery of America and Other Myths: A New World Reader* (San Francisco: Chronicle Books, 1992); Renny Golden, Michael McConnell, Peggy Mueller, Canny Poppen, and Marilyn Turkovich, *Dangerous Memories: Invasion and Resistance Since 1492* (Chicago: Chicago Religious Task Force on Central America, 1991); and Deborah Small with Maggie Jaffe, *1492: What Is It Like to Be Discovered?* (New York: Monthly Review Press, 1991).

<sup>114</sup> (Jefferson, N. C.: McFarland, 1992); *NIQ*, 7, No. 3 (1990). *AICRJ*, 17, No. 3 (1993). See also the special issue on "International Year of Indigenous Peoples: Discovery and Human Rights," *ibid.*, No. 1. (Los Angeles: American Indian Studies Center, UCLA, 1994). On a wider global context see J. M. Blaut, *1492: The Debate on Colonialism, Eurocentrism, and History* (Trenton, N. J.: Africa World Press, 1992), and Merryl Wyn Davies, Ashis Nandy, and Ziauddin Sardar, *Barbaric Others: A Manifesto on Western Racism* (London and Boulder, Colo.: Pluto Press, 1993).

<sup>115</sup> Fernández-Armesto, "In Defense of Columbus: The Trouble with Eden," *Economist*, 321 (Dec. 21, 1991-Jan. 3, 1992), 73-77; Arthur Schlesinger, Jr., "Was America a Mistake?" *Atlantic*, 170 (Sept. 1992), 16ff.; Mario Vargas Llosa, "Questions of Conquest: What Columbus Wrought, and What He Did Not," *Harper's*, 281 (Dec. 1990), 45-53; Karl W. Butzer, "Judgement or Understanding? Reflections on 1492," *Queen's Quarterly*, 99 (1992), 581-600; Wilcomb E. Washburn, "Columbus: Agent of the Inevitable?" *Continuity: A Journal of History*, No. 16 (1992), 57-64.

<sup>116</sup> (Washington, D. C.: Ethics and Public Policy Center, 1992). (Herndon, Va.: Young America's Foundation, 1992).

Historical Association, suggests that the moral heat over the Encounter is still on, at least for some contestants.<sup>117</sup>

During the Quincentenary, a substantial amount of scholarly knowledge and imagination went into the mounting of museum and library exhibits and the publication of exhibition catalogues. The catalogues of five major exhibits give a good idea of the kind of visual richness, aesthetic pleasure, and intellectual value to be found in this genre of Quincentenary scholarship and in the original exhibits.

*America in 1492: American Civilization on the Eve of the Columbus Voyages* is a modest descriptive catalogue of the 100 items included in the Newberry Library's exhibit from January 18 to April 18, 1992. Guest curator and author William R. Swagerty, with the assistance of librarian John S. Aubrey, arranged the books, maps, and manuscripts according to six principal themes to reflect traditional native life in the Americas. From January 29 to March 29, 1992, the Americas Society in New York City was the site of a largely pictorial exhibit devoted to "Guaman Poma de Ayala: The Colonial Art of an Andean Author," curated by Mercedes López-Baralt. The 113-page illustrated catalogue contains six essays by leading Andeanists and art historians; perhaps the most intriguing is Maarten van de Guchte's chapter on European engravings as models for Guaman Poma's drawings.<sup>118</sup>

The earliest of the five catalogues to appear is *Encountering the New World, 1493 to 1800* by Susan Danforth. It was meant less to accompany the 200-item JCBL exhibit that traveled to five sites around the United States between February 16, 1988, and the spring of 1993 than to serve as a full-color album of just seventy-six items, without the narrative thread of the larger show. The whole exhibit is catalogued and reproduced in small black-and-white illustrations in the back. An essay by William H. McNeill contextualizes the exhibit's theme (stated by Norman Fiering) of "what Europeans could know and did know of the New World *visually* before ca. 1800." A similar theme drove the Folger Shakespeare Library's exhibit, "New World of Wonders: European Images of the Americas, 1492-1700," held in Washington from October 8, 1992, to March 6, 1993. The exhibit's eighty-four items were arranged in four sections: the New World, its native peoples, and its commodities; tobacco and chocolate in both worlds; the ritual and theatrical incorporation of American natives; and the novelty of the fourth continent. In the catalogue of the same title, six essays by Folger staff members and scholarly readers (including Alden Vaughan and

<sup>117</sup> Donald A. Grinde, Jr., "Teaching American Indian History: A Native American Voice," *Perspectives*, 32, No. 6 (1994), 1, 11-16, esp. 15; "Letters" from James Axtell and Grinde, *ibid.*, No. 9 (1994), 31-33.

<sup>118</sup> (Chicago: Newberry Library, 1992). Another major Newberry project, *America in 1492: The World of the Indian Peoples Before the Arrival of Columbus*, ed. Alvin M. Josephy, Jr., was also published in 1992 (New York: Alfred A. Knopf). (New York: Americas Society, 1992).

Virginia Mason Vaughan) nicely augment the already meaty item descriptions.<sup>119</sup>

The largest and most ambitious exhibit—with some 360 items—was appropriately mounted by the Library of Congress in its two-story Madison Gallery between August 13, 1992, and February 14, 1993. A small visitor's catalogue lists the show's items without detail or many illustrations. *1492: An Ongoing Voyage*, the larger companion catalogue edited by curator John R. Hébert, reproduces in full color most of the visual images in the exhibit (with lengthy descriptions) and includes seven essays by guest curators Ida Altman and John Fleming and advisor James Lockhart on pre- and post-contact America, the contemporary Mediterranean world, Columbus, and European claims to the new continent. While not directly connected with the exhibit, Louis De Vorsey, Jr.'s *Keys to the Encounter: A Library of Congress Resource Guide for the Study of the Age of Discovery* is immensely useful for interpreting it. In six illustrated chapters, De Vorsey narrates the Columbian achievement, encounter, and legacy from the perspective of a historical geographer. A substantial appendix guides the scholar interested in "Researching the Age of Discovery in the Library of Congress."<sup>120</sup>

The dominant venue of Quincentenary scholarship was the interdisciplinary conference or symposium, many of which have already been mentioned. Its characteristic product was a number of thematically linked contributions, often revised and edited for inclusion in a volume of conference proceedings. A further modest example of the genre is *Columbus: Meeting of Cultures*, edited by Mario B. Mignone. At 120 pages, these proceedings of a two-day symposium held at SUNY-Stony Brook in October 1992 do not set Encounter scholarship on its ear, but they do include thoughtful (if short) work by good scholars such as Foster Provost, James Muldoon, and Marvin Lunenfeld.<sup>121</sup>

Occasionally, the themes of such symposia were too many or too diffuse to result in a coherent volume. A collection that suffers from heterogeneity resulted from a semester-long series of lectures at Santa Clara University in California in the fall of 1992. Its title suggests its thematic problem: *Columbus, Confrontation, Christianity: The European-American Encounter Revisited*. There are excellent essays among the seventeen contributions—particularly Frederick Bowser's on native depopulation and the rise of the African slave trade and David Weber's on seventeenth-century Spanish missions—but the center does not hold. *Race, Discourse, and the Origin of the Americas: A New World View*, the product of a Smithsonian symposium in 1991, suffers from the same lack of focus. It makes a commendable effort to

<sup>119</sup> (Providence: John Carter Brown Library, 1991), ix. Ed. Rachel Doggett with Monique Hulvey and Julie Ainsworth (Washington, D. C.: Folger Shakespeare Library, 1992).

<sup>120</sup> (Washington, D.C.: Library of Congress, 1992). (Washington, D.C.: Library of Congress, 1992).

<sup>121</sup> Filibrary No. 4 (Stony Brook, N. Y.: Forum Italicum, 1993).

explore the tricultural roots of the American identity in Europe, native America, and Africa, but too many of its fourteen essays are rambling, prolix, speculative, or unrelated to the rest. The authors represent a wide variety of disciplines and institutions, which is usually an asset, but in this case they do not appear to be addressing the same topic or even each other.<sup>122</sup>

The book that resulted from a Smithsonian-University of Maryland conference in May 1989 is more coherent than the conference because editors William B. Taylor and Franklin Pease G. Y. chronologically rearranged the eleven papers on *Violence, Resistance, and Survival in the Americas: Native Americans and the Legacy of Conquest* to allow the papers' overlapping emphasis on survival in various cultural regions from the sixteenth century to the present to emerge more clearly. Perhaps the strongest collection of all is *The Meeting of Two Worlds: Europe and the Americas, 1492-1650*, edited by Warwick Bray, which grew out of a one-day symposium at the British Academy in December 1992. It succeeds because it focuses on a coherent region—Spanish America—within a fairly limited period, the number of papers was manageable, and the Academy invited only the best scholars (mostly British) and gave them plenty of space (and illustrations) to do their job.<sup>123</sup> Unfortunately, too few sponsoring institutions managed to duplicate these conditions during the Quincentenary.

For the past ten years I have been an inveterate Quincentenary watcher and willing participant, seven of them as a member of the American Historical Association's Columbus Quincentenary committee. Because I also teach courses on the age of discovery and the meeting of cultures in the Americas, I felt obliged to keep an eye on the emerging Encounter scholarship. This review essay and its predecessor are the results. The question now is—after surveying some 250 books and countless articles on Columbus and subsequent encounters over 300 years—Is the quality of scholarship and educational enhancement commensurate with our collective investment of time, effort, and money?

My answer is an unequivocal "yes." I have been and remain impressed by the high quality of the great majority of publications. They strike me, as they have struck others, as "notably solid, subtle, varied, and stimulating."<sup>124</sup> I attribute that sustained record to two factors. First, the Quincentenary was an international rather than a narrowly national, chauvinistic occasion; it was also from the beginning, at least in the United States, planned as a time

<sup>122</sup> Ed. Timothy J. O'Keefe (Los Gatos, Calif.: Forbes Mill Press, 1994). Ed. Vera Lawrence Hyatt and Rex Nettleford (Washington, D. C.: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1995). A.J.R. Russell-Wood's chapter "Portugal's African Prelude to the Middle Passage and Contribution to Discourse on Race and Slavery" is on target in every way.

<sup>123</sup> (Washington, D. C.: Smithsonian Institution Press, 1994). *Proceedings of the British Academy*, 81 (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1993).

<sup>124</sup> Ida Altman and Reginald D. Butler, "The Contact of Cultures: Perspectives on the Quincentenary," *American Historical Review*, 99 (1994), 478-503, quotation on 478.

for commemoration and serious reflection rather than for boisterous celebration or commercial exploitation.

Second, the National Endowment for the Humanities, with its Columbian Quincentenary Initiative, promoted pedagogical and scholarly excellence in a way that no other national agency or institution could. In the initiative's seven-year existence, the NEH spent \$31 million in some 386 grants related to the Columbian Encounter theme. (By contrast, the United States Jubilee Commission spent only \$2 million, virtually all for administration.) Twenty-eight NEH grants funded institutes to help secondary and college teachers bring the new scholarship into the classroom; 132 grants went to individual scholars—including 23 Younger Scholars of high school and college age—to facilitate research projects, many of which resulted in books reviewed above; 116 grants were awarded to museums, libraries, and universities to underwrite public programs; and publishers, libraries, and archaeological teams received another 110 grants to subsidize the production of expensive books, databases, and excavations.

To judge by the NEH-sponsored books and museum catalogues I have read, the museum exhibits and conferences I attended, and the archaeological findings I have used, the taxpayers' relatively tiny investment in the Quincentenary must be regarded as a huge success and eloquent testimony to the fructuous power of well-placed seed money. The NEH encouraged and guided myriad lasting and long-range contributions to scholarship, many yet to come; it helped Encounter scholarship achieve its pedagogical potential throughout the nation; and its peer review system and staff ensured that the quality of its sponsored scholarly and public programs was maintained at a high level. The planners of future historical anniversaries would be wise to take a page from the endowment's book or, better yet, to invite the NEH to bring its whole book to the table.

The worlds of scholarship and teaching have also gained from the Quincentenary an important adjustment of nomenclature. In one of the NEH's earliest planning sessions, at the Old Post Office in Washington in 1985, at the end of a long day of ethnic and political jockeying, John Elliott commented gently that we should regard post-Columbian America as the product of reciprocal cultural encounters and went on to explain what he meant. The concept and the name stuck, much to our collective, international benefit. As I wrote in 1992, "Encounters are mutual, reciprocal—two-way rather than one-way streets. Encounters are generically capacious: there are encounters of people but also of ideas, institutions, habits, values, plants, animals, and micro-organisms. Encounters are temporally and spatially fluid: they can occur at any time in any place, before or after 1492, around the globe. And, although natives, critics, and activists may not approve the idea, encounters are morally neutral: the term does not prejudice the nature of the contact or its outcome. In sum, encounter is a spacious description that jettisons normative baggage to make room for



disinterestedness and parity.”<sup>125</sup> As long as we recognize that the power in many encounters was unequally distributed, the term retains its usefulness.

The scholarship surveyed here testifies overwhelmingly to the concept’s heuristic power and imaginative potential. The only danger we must guard against is that we will one day use the term as a fashionable cliché rather than as the denomination of a reticulate, constantly changing web of relationships, negotiations, and adjustments. To judge from the outpouring of Encounter scholarship since 1991, that danger seems very far away.

<sup>125</sup> Axtell, “Columbian Encounters: Beyond 1992,” 336.